

12-2008

Sex Trafficking: Explanations and Suggested Solutions

Tylee Potter

Clemson University, tyleelynn@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://tigerprints.clemson.edu/all_theses

 Part of the [Sociology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Potter, Tylee, "Sex Trafficking: Explanations and Suggested Solutions" (2008). *All Theses*. 521.

https://tigerprints.clemson.edu/all_theses/521

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses at TigerPrints. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Theses by an authorized administrator of TigerPrints. For more information, please contact kokeefe@clemson.edu.

SEX TRAFFICKING: EXPLANATIONS AND SUGGESTED SOLUTIONS

A Thesis

Presented to
the Graduate School of
Clemson University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science
Applied Sociology

by
Tylee Lynn Potter
December 2008

Accepted by:
Dr. Sarah Winslow-Bowe, Committee Chair
Dr. Melinda Denton
Dr. Ellen Granberg
Dr. William Haller

ABSTRACT

This thesis employs framing theory (Goffman 1974) to analyze interviews with sex workers and three groups of service providers experienced with sex trafficking: (1) law enforcement officials, (2) social service agents, and (3) health care providers. The data set, "International and Domestic Trends in Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, 1999-2000," was collected in 2000 by Dr. Donna Hughes and Dr. Janice Raymond and entails verbatim interviews on various topics regarding sex trafficking including explanations for occurrence and solutions for combating sex trafficking in the United States. Framing theory was used to analyze the diagnostic and prognostic frames for variation between and within groups and measure the consistency of solutions and explanations. I find that the dominant diagnostic frame was a financial frame, whereas the dominant prognostic frame was a need for law change. Groups vary somewhat in their articulation of frames. Moreover, the prognostic frames do not coordinate with diagnostic frames. In other words, suggested solutions do not match perceived explanations. This thesis adds to the current literature on sex trafficking as it introduces a new perspective for explaining the occurrence of domestic and international sex trafficking, while offering solutions for combating the practice in the United States.

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the women I met at a long neck village in Burma, July 2006. These women explained to me that by putting gold rings on their necks, they devalued their beauty so they were not used as sex slaves. This sole experience inspired me to become more involved in women's issues, particularly in developing countries. The courage these women had to perform dancing shows everyday in order to subsidize their living gave me hope that all women in developing countries can one day find means to provide for themselves and their families other than unwillingly participating in sex work. Particularly, this thesis is dedicated to the parents of these children who had the faith and courage to put rings on their daughter's necks at a young age to protect them from leaving their family and being recruited into sex work.

I would also like to dedicate this thesis to my Sociology Professor during my undergraduate studies at Brigham Young University, Dr. Ralph Brown. Dr. Brown had a remarkable passion for showing students Southeast Asia and teaching them about world religions and social issues abroad. Through volunteering in his Thailand 2006 program, my academic focus changed and I found my passion for helping to improve the economic conditions for women in developing countries. I hope to continue this cause in my future career.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

“Sociology is not a practice, but an attempt to understand.”

--Peter Berger

I am greatly indebted to the support and guidance of my committee chair, Dr. Sarah Winslow-Bowe, along with the constant advice and encouragement of my remaining committee members: Dr Melinda Denton, Dr. Ellen Granberg, and Dr. William Haller. Without their mentorship throughout the program, the skills I learned and the academic achievement I attained would not be possible.

I would also like to thank my family and fellow cohorts who consistently pushed and commended me for the work I was doing. Without their investment in my academic success, I may never have completed the program.

Lastly, I would like to acknowledge the respondents in this study who made it possible for me to write this thesis on a topic for which I am deeply concerned. Thank you to Dr. Janice Raymond and Donna Hughes for conducting this study for my future use.

TITLE PAGE	i
ABSTRACT	ii
DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	iv
CHAPTERS	
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. LITERATURE REVIEW.....	5
Research on Sex Trafficking.....	5
Framing Theory	7
Framing of Social Issues.....	9
Suggested Solutions in Academic Literature.....	12
The Perspectives of Sex Workers.....	16
The Perspectives of Law Enforcement.....	17
The Perspectives of Social Service Agents.....	22
The Perspectives of Health Care Providers.....	28
Literature Summary.....	29
III. METHODOLOGY	31
Data Set.....	31
Research Questions.....	33
Methods of Analysis.....	34
Data Set Advantages and Limitations.....	37
IV. RESULTS	41
Diagnostic Frames... ..	41
Dominant Diagnostic Frames.....	41
Other Diagnostic Frames.....	46
Prognostic Frames.....	49
Comparing and Contrasting Diagnostic and Prognostic Frames.....	55
V. DISCUSSION	59
Implications for Future Research.....	66
Implications for Policy.....	67
APPENDICES....	70
A: Interview Guide for the “Future Goals/ Recommendations Section”	71
B: Diagnostic Frames.....	74
C: Prognostic Frames.....	75
D: Comparing and Contrasting Diagnostic and Prognostic Frames.....	76
REFERENCES	77

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Human trafficking has received heightened attention from politicians, scholars, social services, media, law enforcement agencies, and health care providers in the last decade. Humans are trafficked for various services such as labor, vital organs, and sex. Human trafficking for sexual purposes, known as sex trafficking, is the largest subset (Hodge, 2008). According to the United States Department of State (2007) estimates, 70% of internationally trafficked humans are women, and 70% of those women are trafficked for sexual purposes. It is estimated that the percentage of sex trafficking victims continues to grow as the phenomenon of human trafficking becomes more widespread (US DOS, 2007). According to the Trafficking In Persons (TIP) Report (2007), the largest specific type of transnational slavery in the 21st century is considered to be sex trafficking. This thesis will focus directly on sex trafficking of women. According to the United States Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA), sex trafficking is a practice “in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age” (US DOS, 2007, p. 7).

Understanding the magnitude of sex trafficking in the United States is complicated by the clandestine nature of the issue. Since the practice is illegal, scholars have a difficult time collecting data from victims of trafficking, much less being able to create theoretical models to explain the definition, causes, and potential solutions to

combat the practice (Bales, 2005). To date, the most credible data published on the topic is the United States Department of State's annual Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report which seeks to highlight the governmental efforts to eliminate sex trafficking on the part of sending and receiving countries of trafficked persons. Even though the crime of human trafficking for any purpose is both under-recorded and under-reported, the 2004 TIP report estimated at least 600,000 to 800,000 women and children are trafficked across international borders every year, the majority being trafficked into commercial sexual exploitation (US DHHS, 2004).

Although trafficking may include transporting women across international borders, the number of cases involving domestic trafficking in which United States citizens are transported to various cities and states within the United States against their will is increasing (Farley, 2003). Rural women are most at-risk for being trafficked to urban areas (Naim, 2005). Wherever there is a market for sexual services traffickers will lure women to fulfill the need. Willful prostitution and sex trafficking differ by consent of the women, however, sex work alike promotes exploitation in dangerous environments for the women involved (Naim, 2005). The dangers of prostitution and trafficking are alike, regardless of whether a woman is transported across city limits or whether she is moved to a new country (Farley, 2003, p. 64).

In October 2000, the United States Government passed the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) which prohibits all forms of trafficking in persons. Under the

statutes of TVPA the court system can sentence traffickers to up to twenty years in prison. The TVPA was the first comprehensive United States federal law to protect victims of trafficking by prosecuting their traffickers (US DOJ, 2000). This law explicitly mandates that the victims of trafficking not be punished for illegal documentation, false documentation, and/or being unable to produce valid documentation. Instead, they are to be treated as victims of a crime. In addition, this law entails a tailored visa, T-visa, to protect women in severe forms of trafficking. This visa allows victims to remain in the United States while assisting law enforcement and federal authorities in prosecuting their traffickers and exploiters. Since the law was passed, governmental agencies, nongovernmental organizations, social service agents, health care providers, and law enforcement officials have been on heightened alert to identify and rescue sex trafficking victims. Media attention to the matter has increased and community advocacy has been developing primarily in urban areas of the United States. The numbers of anti-trafficking task forces, outreach efforts and coalitions have increased throughout the United States. This is a monumental effort of local, federal, and state law enforcement along with nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) to combat the practice of sex trafficking domestically and internationally.

Despite federal laws regulating trafficking of persons, the phenomenon still persists. To date, there are few empirical studies explaining the existence of sex trafficking. Similarly, the academic literature on proposed solutions to ending sex trafficking is limited, despite the fact that an understanding of victims' and service

providers' suggested solutions is an important foundation for instating effective measures. The purpose of this thesis is to add to the existing sex trafficking literature by analyzing (1) explanations for why sex trafficking exists and (2) suggested solutions for combating the phenomenon as articulated by victims of trafficking, social service agents, law enforcement officials, and health care providers¹.

The purpose of this thesis is to use framing theory to decipher variation in the suggested explanations and solutions for sex trafficking framed by four different groups of individuals². The groups are: (1) sex workers³, (2) law enforcement officials, (3) social service agents, and (4) health care providers. Each group has experience with victims of sex trafficking and/or anti-trafficking laws and programs. Furthermore, the frames will be analyzed to (1) interpret the ways in which each group articulates their explanations and solutions of sex trafficking, (2) assess the variation of frames within and between groups, and (3) analyze the consistency between diagnostic and prognostic frames of respondents.

¹ Suggested explanations for why the phenomenon occurs will be referred to as diagnostic frames, whereas suggested solutions of combating sex trafficking will be referred to as prognostic frames.

² Frames will be referred to as overall and group-specific based on the specificity of the respondent's response.

³ Sex workers refers to international or domestic women that have/are working in the sex industry in the United States.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

Research on Sex Trafficking

The first reports of women and girls being forced into prostitution were released in the late 1970s and 1980s. Most of the women came from Asia and were sold to brothels to fulfill the tourists' desires for sexual services. The tourists primarily consisted of men from industrialized countries (Naim, 2005). Today, the scope has enlarged and women are being kidnapped, sold, and forced into prostitution from and in nearly every country in the world (TIP, 2007). As human trafficking has become an international enterprise, the focus of combating the phenomenon has become both political and social with the facts and risks involved in the illegal industry being public more than ever before (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001). Most of the literature on human trafficking discusses the actual practice of force, fraud and coercion used by traffickers and pimps to relocate individuals and make them work against their will. As expected, the literature concurs that in order to end sex trafficking, a relentless vision, political determination, and the ability and audacity to contest the demand are all necessary (Koslowski, 2001; McGill, 2003; Naim, 2005). Among several other infringements of the victims, sex trafficking denies these individuals their basic human rights (Hughes, 2003). Advocates and policy makers in this field have focused on fighting for human rights of

women and children everywhere, enabling these individuals to live with dignity regardless of their social class, economic situation, or country of origin.

Anytime a researcher is studying an illegal activity, the necessary data can be extremely difficult to collect. World renown sex trafficking scholar, Dr. Kevin Bales, argues “making an effective response to trafficking requires a multi-stage process, yet at every stage of the process we currently lack systematic research” (2005, p. 17). In essence, with every step to creating credible, empirical data on sex trafficking, the problems with measuring an illegal practice persist, limiting the type of data and collection methods of the study. Resolving the lack of empirical data assessing the size of the phenomenon is imperative to charting an effective solution plan (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001). If empirical studies find the number of involuntary sex workers is smaller than estimated by the United States Government and anti-trafficking agencies alike, receiving countries may authorize visas and legal protection to the victims more freely. Nonetheless, the larger the number of involuntary sex workers, the more complicated the situation becomes for receiving countries and therefore, the remedy may shift to future trafficking prevention while deporting present victims. Regardless of the outcome, empirical research on the phenomenon is imperative to recognizing the causes, purposes, trends, and factual scope of the phenomenon (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001).

Framing Theory

Why does sex trafficking occur? How can we end sex trafficking in the United States? Who is responsible for this phenomenon? Framing theory is a powerful tool for understanding how social movement organizations, politicians, media, and businesses alike operate, articulate their mission and causes, and advocate to the general public for their assistance and support. Frame articulation can be beneficial or detrimental to the social and political dynamics and reputation of any venture. The public collective identity of an entity is developed and sustained through the social and cultural implications of their articulated frames. Frames convey the assembling, understanding, and formulation of meaning, as they assist in creating order of social events, both consciously and unconsciously (Coy & Woehrle, 1996).

Frames are used to articulate the respondents' position on a particular subject of inquiry. Framing theory argues that schemas of interpretation are created by individual actors to socially understand, justify, and/or respond to any issue (Gillian, 2001). The particular relation of the respondent to the specific subject of inquiry will influence their frame. For instance, a school teacher will have a different perspective of what a child needs to be academically successful than would that child's parent based on their experience in the classroom. Erving Goffman was the forerunner in developing and testing the theory of framing. He argued, "Social frameworks provide background understanding for events that incorporate the will, aim, and controlling effort of

intelligence, a live agency, the chief one being the human being” (Goffman, 1974, p. 22).

Scholars have empirically shown how social movements conceptualize their credible work to gain public support by employing framing (Benford & Snow, 2000). In essence, proper framing can allocate meaning and purpose to events or social issues thereby facilitating an understanding of the event and yielding action from bystanders.

The leading scholars of framing, David Snow and Robert Benford, explain the theory as a condensed schema of the greater picture of an event, situation, object, subject, sequence of events, or experience in one’s environment (Benford & Snow, 2000). Often frames are dependent on a number of key entities that use different schemas to articulate the ‘world out there’ based on their level of experience and participation with a particular issue. Frame construction entities can include a number of different groups from sole individuals to large corporations or governments. When frames are collaboratively constructed and used as a call of action to another group, entity, or the general public, the framing style is known as collective action framing. The fundamental purpose of collection action frames is to negotiate the meaning and/or establish an understanding of a particular subject, object, or condition. These frames can be strategically articulated to provide public awareness of issues such as a well needed change, a social problem arising, or a particular party at fault (Benford & Snow, 2000). Collective action frames are used in social movements as a means of soliciting community advocacy and civic engagement in volunteerism. The mission of such

movements is articulated within the frames to gain the attention, interest, and involvement of other individuals.

Under the umbrella of theoretical framing are three core categories: diagnostic, motivational, and prognostic frames (Benford & Snow, 2005). First, diagnostic frames are those which identify a problem. An example of a diagnostic frame is how a given anti-trafficking NGO identifies and explains the reason(s) why human trafficking occurs. Secondly, motivational framing is a heavily used category of framing in social movements. These types of frames are structured to advocate and motivate their audience by producing emotional or cognitive resonance. For example, Schrock et al. (2004) found in their study of a transgender support group that using motivational framing recruited more transgendered activists to the movement. Lastly, prognostic framing is the articulation of recommended solutions to combat and end social issues such as sex trafficking (Benford & Snow, 2005). Since this thesis explores explanations of occurrence and suggested solutions to combat sex trafficking of four different groups of respondents, the primary frames coded in this thesis are diagnostic and prognostic frames.

Framing of Social Issues

Framing theory argues that the articulation of social issues provides a frame of reference for the media, community, and any other persons affected by the issue (Goffman, 1974). Understanding how influential frames are to the government, media,

public, and any other platform for disseminating information, it is vital for frames to remain reliable and consistent to their audience. Regardless, frames vary depending on the position of the respondent articulating an issue, and may include personal bias or neglect pertinent information (Fairhurst & Sarr, 1996). The consistency of the frame, the reliability of the frame articulators or experts in the particular field, and the empirical credibility of studies surrounding a particular issue being framed are three integral factors affecting the credibility of any frame (McCammon, Hewitt, & Smith, 2004). The credibility and believability of a frame are evaluated by the audience; what frame articulators choose to say and how succinctly they articulate themselves is imperative to the success of their cause (Fairhurst & Sarr, 1996). Thus, in order for a frame to be accepted by the intended audience, it must confirm that the respondents are credible sources, the frames are consistent within the particular field, and/or the frame has been tested for credibility. Additionally, if a frame is going to move people to action, it must resonate cognitively or emotionally with the audience by validating something people already believe or explaining something they have always wondered about in a way they find believable.

Framing theory argues the scope of frame construction for social movements or social issues is limited to the pool of experienced personnel within that particular field or a related field if there is no one of such expertise (Goffman, 1974). For instance, in order to better understand solutions of combating sex trafficking, one would not solicit a construction worker for his or her opinion on how to combat the crisis, but interview

agents with the most experience and expertise in allocating services and resources to rescue and rehabilitate the victims of trafficking. While it is ideal to have the primary articulators of frames be experts in the particular field, often times with arising fields and publicly undisclosed social problems, the number of experts in the field is minimal, and consequently the scope of the frames articulated may be too general and uninformative (Benford & Snow, 2000). In such cases, measuring the variations in the frames can help one to assess the validity of the frames and identify the core characteristics of the particular issue or movement.

This thesis will assess the diagnostic frames of explanations and the prognostic frames articulating solutions for sex trafficking across and within the four groups of respondents: sex workers, law enforcement officials, social service agents, and health care providers. Benford and Snow (2000) argue that there are two interrelated factors that influence variation among frame articulation in any one area: the credibility of the most used frame and the relative significance of that particular forerunning frame. Although variation among groups are anticipated, this study will determine to what extent the frames of each group are credible and salient. For example, in an attempt to adopt a worldwide acceptable definition of human trafficking, the United States Government researched the existing definitions and concluded they were all too broad and ambiguous (Hodge, 2008). Nevertheless, the government developed two specifically distinct definitions, one for human trafficking and one for sex trafficking as defined in the TVPA (TIP, 2007). Having only one definition explain the various means of

trafficking would inadequately reflect the criminal practices of the different types of human trafficking. This example illustrates how the framing of issues must specifically encapsulate the issue in order to reach the intended audience and outcomes. For this purpose, the United States Government now endorses two concise, salient frames of human trafficking for the purpose of providing trafficking experts and the general public a better understanding of the phenomenon.

Suggested Solutions in Academic Literature

Despite the fact that prostitution, men soliciting sex from women for money, pimping women and children, transporting women and children across borders for sexual purposes, and running a brothel are all illegal practices, trafficking of persons still exists in the United States. Academics have argued for instating a range of legal measures to combat the occurrence. First, although the persons convicted of pimping, trafficking, or soliciting sexual services from women are criminalized, the literature questions if these laws are being enforced (Hughes, 200; Jones, et al., 2007; Bales, 2005). For example, the United States Government has roughly estimated 600,000-800,000 women victims of sex trafficking have been received into the United States. This estimation is large for a country where prostitution, forced servitude, and trafficking are illegal, indicating illegal crime is a substantial industry in this country (Hughes, 2002). Hughes (2002) argues the United States is in need of a public registration law of traffickers and pimps so the general public can identify when one is in

the area. Such an approach is similar to the identification and street address of all sex offenders in the United States. In doing so, the public is made aware of the risks associated with members living in their community and can alert law enforcement officials to any suspicious actions of the predators.

Several of the suggested solutions focus on innovative ways of countering the demand for women and children for sexual purposes (Omelaniuk, 2005; Kyle & Koslowski, 2001). One such way is by increasing awareness. In doing so, men inclined to buy sexual services may feel more apprehensive when they know how physically and emotionally detrimental these services are to sex workers (Hyland, 2001). One sex worker argued, *"I think it's time overdue to educate men, instead of focusing on women...nobody really wants to be a prostitute"* (Raymond and Hughes, 2001). Also, the literature unanimously addresses the dire need for public awareness of sex trafficking occurring in the United States as opposed to the way media often portrays it as an international problem (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001; Naim, 2005; Saunders, 2005; Segrave & Milivojevic, 2005).

The number of traffickers apprehended and victims rescued is increasing as the United States Government, NGOs, service providers, and the general public become more involved in the campaign to end sex trafficking. As these numbers increase, more grant opportunities have become available through the United States Government for research to empirically assess the practice of sex trafficking on this continent (Gozdziak,

& Collett, 2005). Scholars and social service agents recently have channeled their focus to women in the United States and their risks of being trafficked within the country (Coalition Report, 2006). Little systematic, empirical, and methodological research has been conducted but recent articles on sex trafficking consistently indicated sex trafficking is a larger domestic problem than documented (Desyllas, 2007).

Another suggested solution is to provide economic opportunities to women in developing countries through increasing international development (Bales, 2005). A major pull factor of sex work is the opportunity to overcome economic barriers. Such barriers include limited economic opportunities for women in developing countries in particular, coupled with limited opportunities for education and the need to provide for not only themselves, but their families (Bales, 2005). The devastated economies of developing nations create a quandary for a large portion of the population to feel the stress of economic disparity and vulnerability. This solution is much more difficult to implement because there is no quick fix to reducing the financial desperation of women in areas that offer no financial opportunities to provide for themselves and their families. Fundamentally, the economic barriers of the general workforce are such that the supply must meet the demand in order for workers to make money. This may be the reason many researchers are inclined to suggest increasing public awareness. This solution is much more feasible than creating jobs and more lucrative financial opportunities for women across the world. Regardless of the solution, it must be

enforced worldwide as the sex industry involves women in almost every country in the world (Bales, 2005).

Scholars Kyle and Koslowski (2001) suggest a number of similar solutions, such as empowering victims by providing protection and assistance to all, regardless of their nationality. They argue that such empowerment will grant women practical options for a healthy future. The options suggested include humanitarian aid, shelters, witness protection and/or long term guarantees of protection when needed, and visas to stay in the receiving country and/or deportation if the women so choose. Kyle and Koslowski (2001) argue that oftentimes women only receive the support they need from the receiving government and local agencies in return for cooperating with law enforcement, yet they deserve to automatically receive assistance regardless of their cooperation with law enforcement. Knowing the mistreatment the victims have received, governments and agencies of receiving countries are ethically bound to provide victim relief.

The United States Government and NGOs alike have supported the collaboration of service providers and experts in the field to identify and understand sex trafficking better for the purpose of providing relief to its victims while ending the practice. Such services rendered on behalf of the collaboration of multiple providers include training on how to identify a victim of sex trafficking, where to refer victims for help, which local organizations can help the women with their immediate needs, and interview

techniques for helping these women cooperate with law enforcement (Segrave & Milivojevic, 2005). Additional approaches in the literature include: more informed law enforcement, greater public awareness, broader media attention and targeted education campaigns in the United States, and participation from past sex workers in building an effective victim relief plan (Bales, 2005; Farr, 2005; Kyle & Koslowski, 2001; Naim, 2005). Kyle and Koslowski (2001) summarize this multi-faceted approach when they write:

“To create effectively targeted programs and help empower the women forced into prostitution, such support programs should be developed in conjunction with trafficking victims rather than designed solely by government officials and feminist organizations. Should humanitarian and gender-based considerations not suffice in structuring a comprehensive strategic package, practical law enforcement reasons also counsel to pursue such a path” (p. 277).

Although the literature makes reference to such support rendered on behalf of anti-trafficking agencies and service providers, the efforts and actions have not been evaluated empirically to understand if each agency is addressing the needs of the victims. Below I review the literature on the perspectives of sex workers and victims of trafficking, law enforcement officials, social service agents, and health care providers.

The Perspectives of Sex Workers

Regardless of their country of origin or the type of sex work they perform, domestic and international trafficking victims alike have reported enduring the same type of experiences from their traffickers. Such reports include the coercion methods

used to entangle them in the industry, the traumatic lifestyle of the sex industry, and the exploitation they suffered (Hyland, 2001, p. 42). To date, most academic data has been collected using qualitative interviews of victims of human trafficking. One such study found through interviewing sex trafficking victims in Europe that the fundamental request of victims was for advocates to assess the needs and roles of women globally (Goodey, 2003). Goodey (2003) suggests a three-pronged approach to ending sex trafficking: prevention of the problem, prosecution of the traffickers/pimps, and protection for women at risk and victims. The victims explicitly argue that before any of these methods are enforced, world leaders need to recognize and improve the economic and social state of women so they are not at risk for being trafficked. This research thus suggests that victims of sex trafficking would point to a need for public awareness, attention to the safety of trafficked women and criminalization of traffickers, and addressing the financial opportunities of women (Goodey, 2003). Based on the limited literature dealing with sex workers and their explanations and solutions for sex trafficking, one would expect to find their arguments focused on global issues such as financial constraints facing women in developing countries, coupled with suggestions of creating economic opportunities for women in their home countries.

The Perspectives of Law Enforcement

The United States has recently joined the international initiative to combat trafficking through victim's assistance and federal anti-trafficking legislation. Previous

to passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (2000), no law existed to protect victims of trafficking through prosecuting their traffickers. The TVPA differs from standard kidnapping laws as it pertains to women in the sex industry who are either forced into the work, or once in sex work, are held against their will. Often times with domestic trafficking, women may choose to prostitute themselves, but overtime a pimp or a trafficker picks them up and essentially 'owns' them, giving them little to no freedoms or means of escape. As of 2000, the United States has dramatically increased the penalties for trafficking offenses. The benefits of such are two fold: (1) it reduces the demand of acquiring women and children for sexual purposes and (2) it allows law enforcement officials to bring justice to the victims by prosecuting traffickers and pimps (Raymond and Hughes, 2002).

Law enforcement officials are key figures in identifying victims of sex trafficking. Although trafficking is an international issue, local law enforcement officials are more likely than federal agents to encounter crimes of sex work, such as sex trafficking (Wilson, Walsh, & Kleuber, 2006). In order to convict the traffickers and pimps, they must first be identified and testified against by their victims. Law enforcement has documented that the best way for this process to occur is through first identifying the victims and in turn using them to prosecute their trafficker/pimp (Wilson, et al., 2006). Raymond and Hughes (2002) also argue that women are vital to identifying and prosecuting traffickers/pimps. Unfortunately, most immigrant women, particularly those undocumented and trafficked abroad, are terrified of reporting crimes against

their trafficker/pimp because they fear they will be reported to the Immigration and Naturalization Service or the police, and deported or returned to their trafficker/pimp (Bales, 2005).

The prosecution of traffickers has great potential for preventing the further trafficking of women and children. In the last decade, law enforcement has used the liberties under the TVPA to break up trafficking groups and imprison pimps and traffickers, which in turn limits and/or stops the recruitment and process of sex trafficking (Wilson, et al., 2006). This process may appear to be the most effective for ending sex trafficking but in reality it has proven to be the most difficult strategy thus far. One explanation for the complexity of this strategy is, as laws stand today, law enforcement officials have reported that when they identify and prosecute traffickers/pimps, the penalties are not great enough to prosecute the individual and keep them off the streets, out of the way of harming additional women. Another legal method to combat trafficking suggested by Dr. Kevin Bales is to provide additional opportunities for immigrants to legally work in the United States. These opportunities would provide a legal alternative for people to work in the country instead of depending on traffickers to produce false documentation for them to work abroad (Bales, 2005, p. 162).

The way law enforcement frames the problem of sex trafficking to the general public speaks volumes about how the everyday American will identify with victims of

human trafficking. For example, when prostitutes are caught soliciting sex, law enforcement incarcerates and/or fines them for their illegal behavior (Naim, 2005). In reality, these women may be forced by a pimp or trafficker to work the streets or turn Johns in a brothel and are thereby forced and coerced to participate. “When much of the focus is on the supply, the result is increasing scrutiny of the women’s lives, motivations, and circumstances, as if they are responsible for the crimes committed against them” (Hughes, 2002, p. 184). This example illustrates how the frames of law enforcement are imperative to directing responsibility to the persons causing the exploitation and not the women being exploited.

Another vital position of law enforcement is to identify the factors that put women at risk for being trafficked, known as the push and pull factors. While it is necessary for law enforcement officials to identify women at-risk for being trafficked and what a victim of trafficking may look like to the general public, without an understanding of the push and pull factors breeding the phenomenon, law enforcement, along with other agencies alike, may wrongfully blame the victims. Academic literature on law enforcement’s perspective of sex trafficking has been conflicting, with some suggesting that law enforcement see women as victims or criminals (Bales, 2005).

Some law enforcement officials see women as targets, while others blame the women for their perceived willing engagement in immoral sex work. Unfortunately, the

framing of women in sex work as “illegal migrants and as immoral has informed and prevented effective policy making and law enforcement against the traffickers. The portrayal of trafficking victims has also hampered the provision of legal protection and assistance to them” (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001, p. 282). Akin to the portrayal of women choosing to perform sex work, law enforcement often disbelieve women were forced into sex work and/or are being held against their will by pimps and traffickers. More often than not, law enforcement officials view the women as either criminals or accomplices of crime (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001, p. 275). This myth perpetuates when women show no signs of distress or physical violence (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001).

Conversely, the literature also suggests that law enforcement frequently frame the explanation as ‘exploitation’ of women. They argue that no person should be denied of their human rights and for that reason, these victims need to be rescued and justice meted to pimps and traffickers forcing the victims to exploit themselves (Bales, 2005; Kyle & Koslowski, 2001). The frames articulated by law enforcement are significant contributors to identifying the party at fault, traffickers and pimps, taking the focus off of the innocent victims providing the sexual services (Farr, 2005). If law enforcement recognized the unwillingness of the women to participate in sex work, and offered them protection and victim rehabilitation once identified, they could more abundantly prosecute their traffickers and pimps (Naim, 2005; Kyle & Koslowski, 2001).

Given the literature on sex trafficking and the influence law enforcement has on combating the issue, one would assume their solutions would derive from the recent measures the United States Government has taken in creating new anti-trafficking laws and the TVPA. Such solutions would include increasing laws and the severity of penalties against traffickers and pimps.

The Perspectives of Social Service Agents

A number of nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) offer social services, some of which are sex trafficking specific. For example, United States NGOs combating sex trafficking include the Coalition Against Trafficking Women (CATW)⁴, Initiative Against Sexual Trafficking (IAST)⁵, Free The Slaves (FTS)⁶, and The Emancipation Network (T.E.N)⁷. Often NGOs consist of social workers dedicated to enabling social justice for every individual, especially the weak and oppressed (Hodge, 2008). Although social workers are an integral part of NGOs in advocating for the rights of exploited people, little social work research has been conducted and/or published on human trafficking. Considering the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime has reported that human trafficking has affected epidemic proportions of people in the United States and globally, more research of how social service workers can tailor and address the issue of human trafficking is essential to combating the phenomenon (UNODC, 2005).

⁴ www.catwinternational.org

⁵ www.iast.net,

⁶ www.freetheslaves.net,

⁷ www.emancipationnetwork.org

Human trafficking is not a recently born international practice; however, the scope of the problem has been exacerbated through globalization (Hopkins, 2001). Part of the issue NGOs are facing in their anti-trafficking agendas is whether or not to focus their attention on domestic or international cases of sex trafficking (Farr, 2005). The bulk of public and governmental attention thus far has been focused on international trafficking. The technological advancements expediting global information, transportation, and communication processes throughout the world are the same as those accelerating international crime (Kyle & Koslowski, 2001, p. 335). Scholars agree globalization now requires social workers to widen their perspective of sex trafficking from developing countries being the sending countries, with developed countries the receiving countries, to every country in the world having the capacity of being a sending, receiving, or domestic trafficking country (Engstrom, et al., 2007).

Human rights legislation must pertain to all women, international or domestic, or else law makers are at risk of depriving victims of alternative economic options, rehabilitation, and personal freedom (Raymond & Hughes, 2002). Although sex trafficking is an intra-country issue, looking at the broader picture of international trafficking and globalization and how the United States is affected by the perpetual trafficking of women will assist social service agencies in accurately measuring the scope of the phenomenon. In order to address preventative and combative methods of addressing sex trafficking, remedies must be implemented on a global scale involving collaborations of anti-trafficking coalitions of countries and NGOs. Such coalitions have

only recently begun to spread to an international scale. Completing this process will likely take many years.

Social workers are a tremendous asset in identifying the 'push' factors of sexual trafficking (Bales, 2005). Push factors are factors that create an environment to perpetuate human trafficking. Such factors include economic deprivation, a lack of community development, and a need for sexual services. One suggestion for counteracting push factors is to educate women on the true nature of the sex industry, along with the coercion methods of traffickers and pimps (McGill, 2003). Fundamentally, the purpose of the social work profession in their anti-trafficking agendas is to ensure that the human rights of the victims are and will be protected (Hodge, 2008). Although research on sex trafficking is limited, scholars unanimously argue traffickers prey on women that are vulnerable regardless of their nationality (Bales, 2005). Bales (2005) argues that women are made vulnerable due to low self-worth, social deprivation, physical disabilities, and/or the financial burden of maintaining a family without financial opportunities. These stressors happen to women in industrialized countries as they do to women in developing countries. For example, Raymond and Hughes (2002) found financial issues to be a major push factor for women engaging in the sex industry.

“Trafficking is precipitated by economic conditions in sending countries. Depressed, stagnant and collapsed economies, high rates of unemployment, women being driven from jobs once held, as in Russia, and desperation to find a living somewhere push women to leave their countries and make them vulnerable to the recruiters and traffickers” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 90).

Also, traffickers realize the great demand that exist for sexual services and therefore, they may look anywhere, regardless of the country, to find women to supply the demand. Hodge (2008) argues that fewer women would choose to work in the sex industry if they had other economic opportunities; if this wasn't the case, there would be a minimal turnover rate in the sex industry. For most women in the sex industry, providing sexual services for their clients was not a choice; it was a means of survival (Raymond & Hughes, 2002).

A major anti-trafficking agenda of social workers is to provide viable arguments of advocacy on behalf of the victims in order to persuade the United States to construct internationally inclusive laws summoning all countries to have a zero-tolerance policy for trafficking in their country (TIP Report, 2007). In order to achieve such advocacy, social services must establish international ties and collaborate with victim advocates working in the field all over the world. In addition, policies and services rendered on behalf of the victims must be coordinated between countries and task forces to better distribute necessary resources for combating the international issue (Segrave & Milivojevic, 2005).

Since trafficking into prostitution is a common destination of trafficked women, Bales (2005) argues a viable solution is for social workers to consider adopting measures to reduce the demand for prostitution (Bales, 2005). One such measure is educating the public, primarily men, about the devastating effects prostitution has on the women of the sex industry. This strategy could curb the number of men willing to risk the wellbeing of women for their sexual pleasure (Bales, 2005). Furthermore, it is imperative that the effect that legalizing prostitution has on sex trafficking be tested empirically. Studies conducted in Europe have shown mixed results, in which legalizing prostitution increased the demand for sexual services and thus created a larger market for trafficked women; yet on the other hand, not legalizing prostitution has also perpetuated the demand for sexual services, causing traffickers to keep their victims hidden yet still working in the sex industry (Hodge, 2008). This is another avenue of research for social services. If research finds prostitution affects trafficking rates, social services can petition law makers to either legalize or criminalize prostitution.

As far as domestic sex trafficking is concerned, victims in and from the United States are in need of educational programs offering occupational skills and confidence for attaining a job providing financial independence and economical stability (Jones, et al., 2007). NGOs have recognized the importance of educating women in order to prepare them for a life outside of sex work. Recently, these organizations have begun the stages of improving their facilities and collaborating with other organizations to develop courses for victims to learn job skills for career placement. To date, only the

organizations with actual shelters provide such service to the rescued victims (Jones, et al., 2007). In addition, all women regardless of their nationality are in need of recuperative services while safely exiting sex work (Jones, et al., 2007). The victims also have the option of using the witness protection program if needed, in addition to being eligible for United States citizenship in three years (Raymond & Hughes, 2002).

Although federal law mandates victims are offered such services, social workers and NGOs play a key role in facilitating victim's knowledge of such services. Hodge (2008) suggests multidisciplinary teams be organized through the anti-trafficking efforts of social workers. The teams would combine professionals with expertise in identifying victims, law enforcement, and service providers to rehabilitate the women so they can make a seamless transition out of the sex industry while their perpetrator(s) are being prosecuted. In addition, Hodge (2008) suggests social service workers contact their local representatives requesting resources for enforcing existing laws.

Given the literature on social work, one would assume their framing methods will encompass a range of suggestions stemming from providing for the psychological needs of victims to developing stronger laws and means of prosecuting traffickers and pimps. One could also expect the frames would entail collaborating with national and international anti-trafficking agencies. In doing so, social service agencies have the potential of broadening their strength through collaborating on educating the public and seeking financial and volunteer support.

The Perspectives of Health Care Providers

One of the immediate critical needs of trafficking victims is medical and psychological help. One victim of sex trafficking explained her experience in sex work,

[Prostitution] is terrible. The ramifications of the sex industry are so great. No human being should have to be subjected to working in the sex industry for survival. ...Until you've been there, and you experience the demoralization and dehumanization, there's no way that you could condone it" (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.99)

Social service agents are frontline workers assisting the victims with their well-being, however their expertise only extends so far. To address the health and well-being of victims, social service agencies are starting to form alliances with health care professionals for the purpose of not only providing medical attention, but identifying victims (Farr, 2005). According to the United States Department of Health and Human Services (2004), health risks that are common in victims of human trafficking include sexually transmitted diseases; pregnancy resulting from rape or prostitution; bruises, scars and other signs of physical abuse and torture; substance abuse or addictions; malnourishment and serious dental problems; infectious diseases like tuberculosis; undetected or untreated diseases, such as diabetes or cancer; psychological trauma, including depression; stress-related disorders; and disorientation, confusion, phobias and panic attacks.

Due to the amount of physical and psychological damage a victim of trafficking may face, these women require the attention of health care providers in order to be

rehabilitated to a normal, healthy lifestyle. The academic literature on health care providers as it relates to sex trafficking is near absent. One may assume that the framing methods used by professionals of this field may encompass a lack of knowledge of the phenomenon, followed by a need for suggestions on how to treat victims for their physical infirmities. Additionally, increased training in identifying victims and traffickers escorting victims to receive medical attention may be suggested.

Literature Summary

Given the dynamic and ongoing process of framing, I anticipate the frames I find will vary based on the context for which the interviewee has experience in the sex industry. Research in other fields has yielded similar results. For example, Kissane and Gingerich (2004) found discrepancies in non-profit directors' and poor residents' perceptions of neighborhood problems and necessary services. Although both groups identified drug abuse as a problem, residents also named crime and violence, while non-profit directors focused on unemployment and a lack of education. This research demonstrates that depending on one's position, the same conditions can be interpreted differently across groups. Similar variation is expected of the diagnostic and prognostic frames proposed by victims of trafficking, law enforcement officials, social service agents, and health care providers. Lastly, Joachim (2003) argues that framing theory would predict consistency in diagnostic and prognostic frames in order for frames to be

credible and salient. A lack of consistency would detract from the legitimacy and strength of a frame, particularly as it pertains to social movements.

CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY

Data Set

The data for this research is a restricted-use data set entitled “International and Domestic Trends in Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, 1999-2000,” currently archived at the National Archive of Criminal Justice Data (NACJD). The data were collected by Dr. Donna Hughes and Dr. Janice Raymond for the nongovernmental organization, Coalition Against Trafficking Women (CATW). Their project constitutes the first research project to study the trends in both domestic and international trafficking, including prostituted women in the United States, to better understand the differences in treatment of prostitutes versus trafficked women. Overall, 128 individuals were interviewed; however, due to multiple individuals interviewed simultaneously and missing data, 104 interview files were used for the study. The breakdown of the respondents is as follows:

- Sex Workers: 41 Interviews; (16 International and 25 Domestic);
- Law Enforcement Officials: 19 Interviews;
- Social Service Agents: 38 Interviews;
- Health Care Providers: 6 Interviews

Unfortunately, no reliable generalizations can be made from the limited number of health care provider respondents; nonetheless, I utilize these respondents in my analysis of commonly articulated diagnostic and prognostic frames. Another special

note regarding respondent breakdown: of the 16 international women in the sex industry interviewed, five reported still working in the industry; of the 25 domestic women interviewed, six reported still working in the industry. Whether or not these women are at liberty to leave the industry at their own will was not disclosed.

Moreover, in this sample women in the sex industry are not distinguished based on their entry or position in the sex industry (i.e., willful prostitution or trafficked for sexual purposes), rather they are divided based on their country of origin (domestic or international). Although the interviewers attempted to identify each respondents' experience as either prostitution or trafficking, the purpose of this thesis is not to determine case by case which respondents are considered prostitutes or trafficking victims. Instead, this study will use their experiences in the sex industry collectively to answer the research questions.

This method of combining trafficking victims' interviews with that of prostitutes was chosen based on literature that the physical, emotional, and sexual abuse encountered by prostitutes is similar, if not identical, to the treatment reported by sex trafficking victims (Farley, 2003). Since the focus of this thesis is identifying solutions to combat trafficking of women, the opinions and experiences of all women in the sex industry regardless of whether they have consented at one point to the exploitation (prostitutes) or are held against their will to perform sex acts (sex trafficking victims) may be beneficial in determining future solutions for ending sex trafficking.

The data are comprised of verbatim questions and responses from telephone and in-person interviews. Although the interview guide for the study follows the path of identifying how women were first recruited for the industry to how they survived the experience, the scope of this thesis focuses on the final section of questions in the interview, “Future Goals/Recommendations.” With the interview data I will code the responses of the interview questions asked in the section according to the interview guide (see appendix A)⁸. The particular questions vary per group (see Appendix A), but speak to the same overall themes: (1) The explanations for why sex trafficking occurs and (2) the solutions to combat sex trafficking in the United States.

Research Questions

This thesis seeks to answer three primary research questions:

1. *What diagnostic and prognostic frames are used to address the explanations and solutions of sex trafficking?*
2. *Is there variation across groups in these frames?*
3. *Do the prognostic frames match the diagnostic frames?*

Each of the three service groups experience different levels of engagement with sex trafficking based on their expertise, making them fundamental figures in articulating diagnostic and prognostic frames. These articulated combative frames may be prominent in soliciting support for their cause and campaign to end the practice.

⁸ Questions are taken verbatim from the Interview Guide of the User Guide and Data Collection Instrument.

Framing theory explains the action and movement created by the way a particular piece of information is articulated. When successful, the frame created empowers movement activists, law makers, and professional experts to further their campaign by gaining the attention of their intended population (McCammon, Campbell, Granberg, & Mowery, 2001).

Methods of Analysis

The content of the responses were coded and analyzed to answer the research questions using Atlas.ti, a qualitative software program. Conducting a content analysis of the interview data allowed me to make inferences from the text to code open-ended questions, extracting the anti-trafficking focus of the four groups of respondents (Weber, 1990, p. 9). I coded the “Future Goals/Recommendations” section of each interview using the suggested method of Coy and Woehrle (1996) to code text patterns of diagnostic and prognostic frames. Such codes highlighted ideas and language used to detect frequent frames. Through coding I anticipated finding similarities and differences of the interviewees in a particular group that could be used to decipher themes and specific frame criterion (Kissane & Gingerich, 2004). For example, in the interview data analyzed by Kissane and Gingerich (2004), recurring issues stated by respondents were found in the analyses and coded as the major problems facing poor residents’ communities. These recurring answers were then used in the final report to justify what problems the directors and residents felt were the most prevalent.

The same process was employed for this thesis to determine which diagnostic and prognostic frames were suggested by each group, along with the frequency of the suggestion to determine the dominant group-specific frames. Undoubtedly there will be variation among respondents, but much of the content should correlate to the other members within the group. For example, in a study of strategic frames used in the women's suffrage movement, McCammon et al. (2004) found the two major frames targeting support of the specific audiences were: (1) justice frame and (2) reform frame. Both frames were used strategically based on the counter frames received by pessimists in the community. This study is one example of how multiple frame styles may be used by each group based on the intended audience, or in the case of this thesis, the service they provide.

I used an inductive approach to analyze the data. I began by reading an assortment of full interviews to get a better understanding of the type of questions asked, the data retrieved, and which portion of the interview would be the most beneficial for my data analysis. Upon doing so, I chose to code the "Future Goals/Recommendations" section to narrow my focus. The text that spoke to diagnostic and prognostic frames was coded and analyzed to generate dominant overall frames or themes (see Table 3.1 and 3.2). If the content fell into more than one frame, it was coded according to the best fitting frame as determined by the remaining content of the response. If no remaining content existed, the section was marked with both codes.

Codes that were often used simultaneously were further evaluated and often combined for precision and accuracy of coding (Kissane & Gingerich, 2004).

Each interview was coded using the number of codes necessary to succinctly dissect the frame(s) used by each respondent. The method of content analysis was used to discover overall frames such as 'financial' and 'drug use,' both requiring further analysis of the content to extract more concise group-specific frames. As I analyzed the overall frames, I looked for keywords and phrases known as frame amplifiers that highlight particular issues, situations, and faces of a particular suggestion. Therefore, once coding of the overall frames was complete, I continued dissecting the codes into smaller, more detailed group-specific frames to develop a code tree where all of the codes are conceptually linked. The tree allowed me to find topical fields based on the most used codes, creating patterns in the interview responses (Kissane & Gingerich, 2004). I then further analyzed which codes fell into each particular frame, deciphering the appropriate placement of the responses. This process allowed the diagnostic frames and the prognostic frames articulated by each respondent to surface within each group. Based on the response articulated, I chose a code name to exemplify the type of diagnostic/prognostic frame suggested (Steinberg, 1998). The frame names chosen for this study most accurately depict the content of the respondents in framing the explanations and solutions. Finally, these frames were used to answer my research questions.

In conclusion, this thesis explores how sex workers and various groups involved with women in the sex industry frame the explanations for why sex trafficking occurs, along with the solutions they suggest for stopping sex trafficking in the United States. In addition, I analyzed the vitality and credibility of the diagnostic and prognostic frames of each of the four groups by examining the variation between and within each group of respondents (Benford & Snow, 2000). Furthermore, this study cross analyzed the prognostic and diagnostic frames to see if the proposed solutions matched the explanations for why sex trafficking occurs. In doing so, the study revealed whether respondents were consistent in suggesting the same type of remedies needed as the explanations they argued. Lastly, looking at the frames of each group of respondents, readers can gather a better idea of the types of service group(s) for which the frames were targeted, such as, policy makers, law enforcement, social service agents, health care providers coworkers, and the general public (McCammon, Hewitt, & Smith, 2004).

Data Set Advantages and Limitations

This data set was advantageous because it was the only data set available, and it provided versatility in developing my research focus because it encompassed the perspectives of many groups of individuals. Although this research projected was conducted in 2000, there have been very few empirical studies conducted on sex trafficking since, and none involving the same groups of service providers.

As with all data sets, this data set has limitations. One limitation is the quote restrictions. Throughout this study, respondents communicated exemplary statements illustrating their suggested diagnostic and prognostic frames, however, the terms of the restricted data set only authorized the use of quotes used in previous publications. This limitation will be addressed by (1) using previously published quotes, italicized within the results section, (2) paraphrasing of quotes, and (3) using statements made by researchers that illustrate a similar phrasing mechanism.

Another limitation of this study is the percentage of respondents in all four groups that did not respond to the pertinent questions of this study. This may be due to respondents not being asked the question, not understanding the question, or deciding the question was unworthy of response. Although these explanations are viable assumptions for non-response, there is no way to definitely know which of the three scenarios explains each case of non-response. The number of unanswered questions vary, however, it was a recurring issue as I analyzed the content of the interviews. Of all four groups of respondents, sex workers as a group have the greatest amount of non-response (see Table 3.1 and 3.2). This limitation is particularly unfortunate as sex workers would be the most direct source of information. Possible explanations for non-response among sex workers are a language barrier among international women, fear of retribution from traffickers/pimps for women currently in the sex industry, and fear of prosecution for participating in illegal sex work. In all, I addressed this limitation by focusing on the dominant themes of the questions with responses. In doing so, the

response rates were low on several of the major findings due in part to unanswered questions. This issue was consistent throughout all four groups, although it did vary in magnitude, and therefore, is unlikely to differentially affect the data for any one group in particular.

Another limitation of this study is the variation of respondents in the sex worker group. Any inferences made of sex trafficking by women that are/have been in the sex industry is influenced by the experience of prostitutes, which may be very different than that of victims of sex trafficking. Consequently, the results cannot be taken to reflect trafficking only. Also, if some of the sex worker respondents are still active in the industry, they are unlikely to suggested particular legal measures be taken to combat the phenomenon. If so, they would not have a job.

In addition, the health care providers sample was too small to use as representative of health care provider's specific stance, however the results for their group will be merged with the other groups as dominant overall and group-specific frames are discussed. Additional limitations of this study include the method of analysis. I singlehandedly coded the data for consistency and accuracy. Nonetheless, coding fatigue throughout the process may have caused a few of my codes to be less succinct toward the last few interviews. I rechecked all of my codes for accuracy a week later to make sure I was as consistent as possible, but there still may be human error. Another limitation is the consistency of the frames chosen. At times, codes were so

reflective of each other that I would use two codes for the same statement. For example, several sex workers discussed the diagnostic frames of drug use in such a way that it mirrored financial issues as well. This is discussed in greater detail in the results section.

The advantages far exceed the limitations of this study. Studying a phenomenon with very little empirical data available, a data set of this magnitude is extremely valuable. The versatility of the interview data can be used in a number of ways to analyze the practice more thoroughly. This data set was beneficial for answering my research questions, extracting practical findings for various service providers combating sex trafficking, and providing avenues for future research.

CHAPTER FOUR

RESULTS

Diagnostic Frames

The diagnostic frames can be separated in three overarching groups: financial, personal impairment, and structural. The financial frame involves both financial opportunities for women and financial constraints faced by women. The personal impairment frames consist of drug issues, psychological issues, and sexual abuse, whereas the structural frames include involuntary participation and patriarchy. These frames will be discussed in greater detail below.

Dominant Diagnostic Frames

Of the overall diagnostic frames articulated by the respondents, the most dominant frame across groups was financial issues (see Table 3.1). Out of 41 sex worker respondents, seven domestic and five international women (29%) reported their main purpose for engaging in the sex industry was for financial reasons. In addition, 11 of the 14 law enforcement official (74%), 26 of the 38 social service agents (68%), and two of the six health care providers (33%) gave financial issues as the number one reason women enter the sex industry. Although all four groups reported financial issues as their dominant diagnostic frame, the ways in which they framed the financial issue varied.

One prevalent way financial issues were articulated was by respondents stating women are financially constrained. For example, respondents of every group used dialogue such as women do not have an option because often times they are sold by their families to traffickers as a means for their family to survive. Respondents also used basic explanations such as the women have no money. These examples illustrate how women are constrained by their financial situation and involuntarily choose sex work as a means of survival. In particular, three international sex worker respondents reported having no documentation and money, therefore limiting their opportunities of other work. For example, a respondent shared,

“One customer asked me ‘Why do you do this? Why don’t you do something else? I can see you don’t like it.’ I said, ‘I need to support my life.’ He said, ‘you don’t have to do this.’ I said, ‘Oh really!’” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.89)

This example illustrates how the perception of sex workers from an outsiders point of view may be that women chose sex work, however, once sex workers are candid about their reasons for involvement, their explanations reveal a different picture of their alternatives to sex work being non-existent.

Explanations of the types and means of financial constraints varied across and within groups. Specifically, as it pertains to the financial issues frame, each group had a different perspective of how finances influence not only the reason of occurrence of trafficking, but why it draws women into the sex industry. Law enforcement primarily focused their financial issues framing as a lack of economic opportunities in financially

destitute countries, coupled with women's need to support their families. These two factors created a pull for women to choose to work abroad, and willingly or unwillingly end up in the sex industry with no other options of financially sustaining themselves. In essence, women feel they are bound to sex work because they can make quick money for themselves and/or their families. The respondents did not discuss the financial desperation that may occur within the United States, but primarily focused on the economic conditions of developing countries.

A few respondents mentioned sex work as a way of making quick money. Raymond and Hughes found in their analysis of this data set, "What drew people then was what draws them now—economic prosperity and opportunity in the United States" (Raymond and Hughes, 2002, p.90). Law enforcement officials in particular identified that prostitution was a means of making quick, easy money. Whether the women are from the United States or abroad, sex work is a field in which women can make a lot of cash quickly if need be. The group-specific financial frames we can draw from these financial issues diagnostic frame is sex work is easy money and a means of providing women financial opportunities for themselves and/or families in financially destitute countries. Women have the potential to make lots of money quickly with very little thought and preparation needed to turn the tricks.

Like law enforcement, the social service agents mentioned the need international women often have to provide for their families back home, leaving them

no other financial options than entering sex work. The drive to care for their loved ones entices them to come to the United States and work in the sex industry so they can send money home to their families. Often times these women unwillingly end up in sex work, or choose the job because they arrive in the US, only to find out they are not employable without a working visa or documentation. Evidently, due to their financial constraints, sex work is their only option.

Social service agents tailored their financial issues frame to the vague concept of economic disparity. Most of the respondents discussed numerous explanations of why sex trafficking exists by describing reasons for which women would consent. The most prevalent articulation was sex work is a means of counteracting the financial deprivation of women and children in developing countries. This frame is similar to that of law enforcement as they also argued the same articulation of this frame. More specifically, social service agents argued international women in sex work are desperate to save themselves from the poverty they experience in their home countries, thus they become vulnerable to any person promising them financial opportunities. In addition, a major pull factor of sex work is the idea that women from countries of depressed economies can make a better life for themselves. For example, Raymond and Hughes (2002) articulated a 'financial' diagnostic frame in which they argued,

“Trafficking is precipitated by economic conditions in sending countries. Depressed, stagnant and collapsed economies, high rates of unemployment, women being driven from jobs once held, as in Russia, and desperation to find a living somewhere push women to leave their countries and make them vulnerable to the recruiters and traffickers” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 90).

Of particular importance, sex workers were the only group of respondents who mentioned drug use as a reason. Four domestic and one international sex worker (12%) explained the reason why women commit to sex work is for accessibility of drugs. One sex worker reported her reason for being a sex worker was, *“to feed my habit. First alcohol, then cocaine, a lot of cocaine and then eventually heroin”* (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.92). The data also shows drugs and sex work have a significant correlation as drugs was the second largest diagnostic frame of this group with seven women reporting their explanation for why they work in the sex industry was to get high. Raymond and Hughes (2002) found in their analysis of this data set that all the women who abused drugs were involved in sex work at the time. Coping with sex work was another argument for drug use. One respondent described her drug using as *“I used just enough to get me through [a night of work] to the next morning wake up”* (Raymond and Hughes, 2002, p. 96). One cannot infer whether drug abuse leads to prostitution to support the habit, or prostitution leads to drug abuse to get through the work night. This statement is one example of how drugs are used as a coping mechanism. One prostitute reported,

“Smoking dope and using drugs and alcohol were common ways of coping. I was self-abusive. I hated myself and my life...I would sleep till noon...By 3-4 pm, my boyfriend pimp would get me alcohol. I would get high before I went on the streets at around 7-midnight” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.98).

Financial reasons were another argument for drug use. It is nearly impossible to separate sex worker’s financial issues diagnostic frame from their drug use frames. . The respondents reported becoming involved with drugs around the same time as prostitution. One respondent explained the drugs numbed her from everything: men, sex, life, and physical and verbal abuse. Drugs were the only way for her to live without feeling her life (Raymond and Hughes, 2002). Few respondents discussed the true reality of the drug use involved in sex work. Lastly, coercion was an argument for drug use. Sections of the interviews of sex workers explained how drugs were greatly used as a coercion method of pimps and traffickers to control their victims (Raymond & Hughes, 2002). One sex worker spoke candidly of her pimp drugging her before she would service men, *“We had worked together only for 2 days. He forcefully gave me a shot. I puked all over his room. I got poisoned at once...I was sober until I met him”* (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 93). This is one example of how drugs were often used a means of control and coercion in and through the sex industry.

Other Diagnostic Frames

Of the social service agents, 29% argued the reason why sex trafficking exists is because women involuntarily enter sex work. In essence, this is a frame of coercion in

which social service agents believe women were involuntarily forced into the sex industry, as they were held captive by pimps and/or traffickers who forced them to perform sex work. This frame is also articulated by social service agents claiming that pimps and traffickers find women to coerce into the sex industry, make a profit off of the services they render, and keep the women under their control at all times.

Social service agents also framed sex work as an issue of patriarchy (argued by nine respondents, or 24%). In response to why sex trafficking occurs, one social worker argued, *“It’s all about the man’s ‘need.’ If more opportunities were created for women and the image of women were changed, it would not be necessary to ask about trafficking of women”* (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 90). Patriarchy, as articulated by respondents, refers to the social devaluation of women and entitlement of men.

“Sex trafficking is linked with men’s attitudes toward prostitution. Several interviewees reported that many men who buy women for sexual purposes see themselves as purchasing a service to which they are entitled, and deny that they are engaging in commercial sexual exploitation” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.96).

Due to the commodity women’s bodies have become in unspecified areas of the world, according to the respondents, men feel the liberty to buy and use them as they please, giving no consideration to the human being they are exploiting.

Sex workers did not use the words social devaluation of women or patriarchy in their argument reflecting why sex work is in high demand, however few of the respondents’ arguments also suggested patriarchal values were contributors to men

soliciting sex. For example, one sex worker had a similar articulation to the explanation as social workers and she reported, “...*The men who were using you didn’t really care about you—they didn’t even really care about you being there. They just wanted to do their thing and leave*” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, 93). Further complicating the matter, one social worker expanded the devaluation of women for educational purposes as well, “*Women [especially from sending countries] are also not valued for education...*” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.93). These examples illustrate how patriarchal societies and cultures are major contributors to the perpetuation of sex trafficking, according to social service agents.

Furthermore, various respondents suggested a few personal impairment explanations for why sex trafficking occurs such as social isolation of women, family problems. Additional frames discussed solely by particular groups include law enforcement’s argument that psychological issues were a vital explanation for why sex trafficking exists. According to the respondents, psychological issues were explained as childhood abuse endured by the women, now perpetuated in their adult lives by continually being mistreated in the sex industry. Whether it was sexual, emotional, or physical abuse, the respondents articulating the psychological issues diagnostic frame specified this frame as involving problems, stemming from their adolescence, they are still facing as adults. Likewise, sexual abuse was a diagnostic frame of law enforcement. This frame is similar to psychological issues, but differs in the degree to which it pertains to sexual abuse specifically. The respondents declared that previous sexual abuse,

regardless of their relation to the perpetrator or the age of occurrence, diminishes victims' self-worth while decreasing their desire to protect their bodies. Lastly, respondents indicated sexual abuse affects the individual psyche of the victims, and oftentimes destroys their self-worth and esteem causing the women to feel unworthy of any other job aside from sex. In conclusion, any type of psychological damage, physical, mental or sexual abuse, according to law enforcement, increases the chances that a woman will enter and/or remain in sex work.

Prognostic Frames

Although variation in prognostic frames existed (see Table 3.2), the dominant prognostic frame across groups was legal. The most reported legal prognostic frame was a need for law change. Of the 19 law enforcement officials, 53% reported law change was needed to combat sex trafficking in the United States. Respondents articulated this frame by arguing for measures such as harsher penalties for traffickers and pimps. The respondents articulating this type of legal frame unanimously agreed that stricter penalties would keep people from sexually exploiting women. One respondent argued, *"Penalties must fit the crime"* (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.95). According to the respondents, trafficking and pimping women is not criminalized to the degree of the offense. *"There are higher penalties for trafficking drugs and guns, than for selling women (Raymond, Hughes, 2002, p. 93).*

Law change was also the dominant prognostic frame among social service agents and law enforcement officials. Fifty-three percent of law enforcement officials and 29% percent of social services agents argued not only for a need of stricter anti-trafficking laws, but they specifically requested the enforcement of such laws. Six respondents (32%) suggested a witness protection program should be available to victims in order for them to feel safe and comfortable cooperating with law enforcement in prosecuting their traffickers/pimps. By instating a witness protection program, law enforcement agents argue more victims would be willing to use the legal system and bring justice on their case without fear of retaliation from their trafficker/pimp.

Another articulation of the legal frame dominant among law enforcement was the need for trusted law enforcement. Law enforcement argued that too many of their personnel overlook victims as illegal migrants or immoral prostitutes and thus never investigate the situation to see if the women are being held against their will.

“Trafficked women should not be treated as illegal immigrants but as victims of human rights abuses and violations. Protection of victims is made nearly impossible if trafficked women first and foremost are punished as ‘illegal aliens’” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 95).

If law enforcement were more trustworthy or served as complainant for the victims, more women would use law enforcement to exit the sex industry and escape their trafficker/pimp. This frame occurred in 5 interviews (26%).

In addition to the legal prognostic frames articulated by each group of respondents, concrete solutions were discussed. Three law enforcement officials suggested employing a private detective, because finding and investigating cases of sex trafficking are extremely labor intensive, largely because such cases exist in a hidden market. As a result, in order to bust traffickers and pimps, a private detective experienced in this field is needed to go undercover with wire taps to expose the criminal activity. Conversely, social service agents had a different solution to their legal framing as they argued for issuing visas to victims. Seven respondents (18%) articulated visas are needed for victims to ease the threat of the INS.

“The criminal justice system must be made more immigrant-friendly. Many social service agents reported that the current system hampers victims from coming forward who fear deportation and the lack of INS assurance that victims will not be sent out of the country. International women who have been trafficked and prostituted in the United States sex industries reported this fear of deportation and how it had been used as a threat against them” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p. 98).

Fortunately, since the time the interviews for this data set were conducted, the government has instated a T-visa to protect international victims of trafficking. Other legal solutions suggested by respondents included a need for border patrol and tightly regulating establishments so sex trafficking is not prevalent at massage parlors and strip clubs.

The second most dominant prognostic frame was giving women opportunities. The opportunities frame has two specific articulations: (1) the need to provide women financial opportunities, and (2) the need for women to receive education/schooling. These two frames are interrelated as education can provide the benefit of economic opportunities. One of the most common prominent opportunities frame was the need for education/schooling for women. Six social service agents indicated women need the same schooling as men, whereas two argued women are not valued in their home countries, especially as it pertains to educational opportunities. They have very few economic opportunities, especially if they are not educated (Raymond and Hughes, 2002). One social worker explained the diagnostic frame as *“Women [especially from sending countries]... have very few options in the workforce to make a living”* (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.93). Without providing women other means of personally developing in this world, they will resort to desperate means of sustaining their life. Education provides women with the skills necessary to attain the quality of jobs needed to subsidize their life, or the life of their family. According to these respondents, without making these provisions to combat sex trafficking, women will continually succumb to sex work to make ends meet.

Furthermore, one domestic and one international sex worker (5%), along with 16% of social service agents agreed in order to end sex trafficking in the United States, women must be educated with viable knowledge to sustain a career and be compatible

to their counterparts in the workforce. In addition, sex workers argued they need an education in order to exit sex work. Such responses included their desire for any level of education, or their efforts thus far in attaining an education. Clearly, sex workers understand the importance of education; however, they also understand the restraints of gaining an education.

Suggesting financial opportunities be made available to women was also a commonly noted frame among law enforcement. Four law enforcement officials (21%) and six social service agents (16%) argued financial opportunities for women are essential to preventing sex trafficking. Some respondents argued financial opportunities are needed for women in developing countries entrapped by traffickers due to their financial situation, while others focused on the idea that women exiting sex work need financial assistance in order to make their transition. Social service agents on the other hand were more succinct in their articulation of the financial opportunities frame. When asked what services are needed to prevent women from being trafficked, the most common response was financial/economic assistance. Although this response appears vague, it shows that social service agents recognize the financial pressures of the women in and out of sex work.

Of the health care providers, two respondents (33%) framed financial issues as women need access to affordable housing in order to get off the streets and out of sex work. Although affordable housing is a financial issue, it also falls under the social

services needed frame. For this purpose, affordable housing was coded as both a financial solution and social service solution, but is listed in the table under the latter.

Social service agents argued more social services are needed to combat sex trafficking. In order to stop sex trafficking, six of the respondents argued that all women in sex work, regardless if they are prostitutes or trafficking victims, from the United States or abroad, need to be eligible for social services and need to be aware of the programs that are available. Without knowledge of the programs, the services go unused by women with the most need.

“More resources and services are needed for women in the sex industry and those who have been trafficked—e.g., witness protection programs, health care, housing, shelter, counseling, legal services and financial assistance. Social service agents emphasized that such programs could be expanded and given resources to conduct outreach to internationally trafficked women and collaborate with immigrant women’s organizations and services” ” (Raymond & Hughes, 2002, p.98).

Also, one law enforcement official and three social service agents suggested collaboration within social service agencies would make the services more widespread and accessible to a greater number of women. Four respondents (21%) mentioned women need a place to temporarily reside while they are rehabilitated and are able to get back on their feet. Lastly, other social services solutions suggested by respondents included providing food to victims, language resources, and monetary compensation to provide for their rehabilitation.

Comparing and Contrasting Diagnostic and Prognostic Frames

The primary way to assess the credibility of a frame is through its consistency (Drake and Donohue, 1996). Drake and Donohue (1996) argue conflict intervention professionals, such as all three of the groups studied in this thesis, play an integral part in providing solutions for social issues through their framing style. Studying the coherence of their frames is vital to the effectiveness of their mission because without employing solutions to combat the explanations of a social issue, the fundamental purpose of conflict intervention is neglected. One would implicitly assume that the solutions communicated by respondents would combat the particular explanations they suggested. After analyzing the data, the results are mixed.

Among the 54 respondents articulating a financial diagnostic frame, the least suggested prognostic frame was financial solutions (articulated by 17% of the respondents; see Table 3.3). The most commonly suggested prognostic frame among those articulating financial diagnostic frame was legal (37%), followed by social services needed (26%). Furthermore, among the 11 respondents articulating a personal impairment diagnostic frame, 73% suggested a legal prognostic frame, followed by 63% articulating a financial prognostic frame and 36% articulating social service prognostic frame. Given the type of explanations encompassed in the personal impairment frame, one would expect the social service prognostic frame would be the most dominant prognostic frame, as social service agents are the professionals most likely to work with

personal impairment issues. However, social service solutions were the least suggested by those articulating personal impairment diagnostic frames.

Lastly, among the 22 respondents articulating a structural diagnostic frame, 41% argued a legal prognostic frame, 36% argued a financial prognostic frame, and 27% argued social service prognostic frame. Although none of the three prognostic frames entirely address the structural explanations, such as women joining the sex industry involuntarily and devaluing women, it is still important to see which solutions these respondents are suggesting to better understand which solutions they feel would effectively combat sex trafficking given their explanations for the occurrence. Especially since none of the prognostic frames address these specific explanations, we'd expect the variation found. It is important to note that structural diagnostic frames require structural solutions, so any solution addressing prostitution and systemic issues is consistent with this type of explanation

The type of cohesion being compared in this analysis is not only whether prognostic frames match diagnostic frames, but if the types of solutions articulated by the service providers fall within the services they provide. Given the type of service each group of respondents provides to trafficking victims, one would assume their solutions would match their group expertise. The group analyses show law enforcement articulated financial issues, psychological issues, and sexual abuse as their diagnostic frames, none of which pertained to their niche of work. For their prognostic

frames they argued for the need of law change, instating a witness protection program, employing trusted law enforcement, providing shelter for the women, and using undercover detectives to bust traffickers/pimps, all but one of which pertain to law enforcement. This discrepancy shows law enforcement recognize how vital their job is in stopping sex trafficking, however they fail to mention in their explanations how compromised law enforcement may enable sex trafficking.

The prognostic frames suggested by law enforcement officials were largely associated with the type of work they perform while suggestions of social service agents and health care providers only partially associated or were unrelated to the work they perform. For instance, the diagnostic frames articulated by social service agents include financial issues, women join involuntarily, and patriarchy devalues women and makes men feel women are commodities. Their prognostic frames include law change needed, visas needed, education/schooling needed, and the need for more social services, of which the latter two match their expertise. In addition, the respondents argued educating women can empower them to become increasingly self-sufficient and address patriarchal assumptions.

The analyses also found that although some of the frames slightly differed between individual respondents within groups, there was little within group variation. There appeared to be a trend in the data that groups articulated diagnostic and prognostic frames consistent with other respondents within their field. The only

exception was the differences in the articulation of the financial diagnostic frame of international and domestic victims, as international women focused on economic opportunities of women from developing countries. From this comparison of diagnostic and prognostic frames, we can better understand how salient the frames are within groups of respondents. Although some of the findings were expected, several of the results were surprising, especially as it pertains to the lack of cohesion of dominant diagnostic and prognostic frames. With a few notable exceptions reviewed above, there is remarkably little consistency, suggesting that solutions articulated by key interest groups do not match the explanations offered by these same groups.

CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION

This research on the framing of explanations and solutions to sex trafficking is a new type of exploration of this illegal industry. To date, there are no studies published on the explanations and solutions articulated by sex workers and service providers experienced with sex trafficking. For this reason, this study is an insightful addition to the limited empirical research in the field. Using framing theory has further expanded the literature in several ways. First and foremost, through analyzing the articulated explanation and solution frames of all four groups, sex trafficking scholars and service providers can better understand how people involved in the issue of sex trafficking are thinking about the problem.

Revealing the frames articulated by each of these groups of respondents has shown not only the research implications of these findings, but the possible policy implications as well. As Benford and Snow (2000) argue, the frames articulated by these respondents create an identity for the anti-sex trafficking movement in their explanations and solutions suggested. In response, this identity provides grounds for social activists to create anti-trafficking agenda.

The saliency of frames strengthens the movement for which it is articulated. A comprehensive plan to combat sex trafficking depends in large part on a consistent and coherent articulation of diagnostic and prognostic frames. The frames must be

consistent and coherent in such a manner for the intended audience, such as law makers, social service agents, and health care providers, to be able to develop comprehensive measures to combat sex trafficking (Benford and Snow, 2000). In essence, frames can hold heuristic value when articulated succinctly to the appropriate audience (Drake and Donohue, 1996). This study reveals and explains the dominant diagnostic and prognostic frames articulated by all four groups of respondents, and what these frames mean for future research and policy implications.

Of the dominant diagnostic frames articulated, the financial issues frame was represented in all four groups. Although this frame was noted, the ways in which this diagnostic frame was discussed varied by group. Law enforcement, social service agents, and health care providers all argued on behalf of financially depressed economies of sending countries. With this type of financial deficit frame, the focus was on international women and the struggles they face to subsidize their lives, and potentially the lives of their families. The explanation in this case for why sex trafficking occurs is because there is a demand for sexual services in developed countries that attracts women from under developed economies to travel to the United States in hopes of attaining a better life. The financial crises push women to seek work abroad and thus, by either choice or involuntarily, they work in the sex industry. This financial issues frame differs from that of sex workers. According to the international and domestic sex workers, the financial issues diagnostic frame correlates with that communicated by the law enforcement officials. There is no other job where women

can make as much quick, easy cash. Regardless of where the sex worker is from, international or domestic, prostitution can be a means of gainful employment, anytime, anywhere. Whether women need fast cash to support a drug habit, or to subsidize their personal needs, sex work is a means of making quick cash.

Sex workers' articulation of the financial diagnostic frame vary. Overall, 'easy money' in a lucrative business was the group-specific response from the respondents. Although they suggested the money the women collect from performing sex acts was 'easy money,' they did not explain in which ways the services they provided were easy. In addition to this frame, the economic instability of the sending countries was addressed by five of the respondents, as they argued this created disparity for women as they had to search for illegal work abroad. The variation in this frame mostly consists of two different frames: (1) sex trafficking existing to benefit the women by giving them opportunities for 'easy money,' and (2) international women having no other choice than to sell their bodies to improve their financial situation at home. Most respondents chose one frame or another but few argued both diagnostic frames.

Furthermore, international and domestic sex workers both framed explanations as financial issues, drug use, and women have no other option. An extremely limited sample of the same respondents suggested drug treatment, psychological counseling, and education were solutions to stop sex trafficking. Aside from the drug use explanation and solution, the other two explanations for why sex trafficking occurs are

not addressed as prevention measures in their solutions frames of stopping sex trafficking. Although sex workers did not suggest drug rehabilitation as a prognostic frame, it is important to note that they were the only group to argue drug use as an explanation for women staying in the sex industry. This finding suggests that law enforcement and social services need to reevaluate the significance of drug use in sex work, perhaps providing rehabilitation for victims and sex workers exiting the industry.

The variation in the financial issues diagnostic frame as articulated by social service agents was twofold. On the one hand respondents portray the financial issues frame as a state of economic desperation of sending countries. Additionally, many more social service agents articulated their explanation of why sex trafficking occurs as a poverty issue. This issue is framed as purely an economic problem faced by women that pushes them to the sex industry to fix their financial situation. For a few respondents, both perspectives of this 'financial' frame were articulated, nevertheless, most respondents argued for one of the perspectives. Although the majority of social service respondents framed the explanation of why sex trafficking exists as financial constraints, focusing particularly on the financial issues of providing for oneself, and possibly a family, two respondents took a different perspective to the frame. Pimps use force, fraud, and coercion to manipulate women into the sex industry. These respondents communicated that these women had been sold into the sex industry without forewarning and had little to no opportunity of escaping. As long as there is a market

for sexual services, through coercion traffickers and pimps will find a way to supply the demand.

Of the dominant prognostic frames articulated by each group, the most prevalent frame is legal. This suggestion was argued by both law enforcement officials and social service agents alike. Their perspectives of the changes that need to be made in order to end sex trafficking in the United States were unanimous: stricter penalties and greater enforcement of present laws. Law enforcement mostly articulated prognostic frames in which they actually have the expertise to be involved. For example, many respondents suggested establishing a witness protection program, along with the need for trusted law enforcement. This latter solution suggests that law enforcement are aware and concerned with corrupt officials. If victims cannot trust law enforcement to protect their rights and free them from the bondage they have to their trafficker/pimp, creating new laws against trafficking is ineffective. As a whole the law enforcement group provided suggestions tailored to their particular expertise. This finding suggests that law enforcement recognize the potential magnitude of their job in combating human trafficking.

Unlike law enforcement, social service workers and health care providers did not primarily suggest solutions consistent with their area of expertise. Although 16% of social service agents suggested more social services are needed, this was the only prognostic frame significantly articulated within this group of respondents pertaining to

their field of service. It is imperative for social service agents to focus on work they can do to combat sex trafficking because they are the most likely to work directly with sex workers.

It is of particular importance to note that although financial issues was the most dominant diagnostic frame across all four groups of respondents, there were only two groups who articulated financial opportunities as their prognostic frames. One would anticipate that sex workers would be the first to mention financial help in their prognostic frames due to the reasons they gave for entering the sex industry. However, this was not the case. Presently, there are a handful of nongovernmental organizations that have developed based on this precise need. For example, madebysurvivors.com is an organization providing women in South Africa opportunities to make handicrafts to sell online and in boutiques throughout the United States. As awareness spreads of the economic constraints women face primarily in developing countries, one could assume that prognostic frames will focus more on fixing the financial situation of women. This suggests that the way trafficking is framed influences the perception and actions of the audience interested in combating the issue. As demonstrated in this particular example, the way in which trafficking explanations have been articulated influenced nongovernmental organizations to respond to the economic needs of women in developing countries.

This study also provides insight into the type of service providers needed to address the solutions suggested by each group of respondents. For example, law enforcement officials argued for instating solution measures that fell within their field of service. For example, over 50% of the respondents suggested law changes are needed to end sex trafficking. Although law enforcement officials are not law makers, they do play a significant role in aiding in the process. With the 2000 TVPA passing and a new human trafficking ambassador on Capitol Hill sworn in in 2007, Mark P. Lagon, the United States Government has been more proactive in combating the sex trafficking globally. This study suggests that, to the extent that prognostic frames became motivational frames, further legal and governmental solutions are warranted and may be forthcoming. It is expected to see more studies and grants awarded from the United States Government for empirical research conducted on this topic to continue their relentless effort to combat the international phenomenon.

Finally, this thesis draws insight from the lack of consistency between the diagnostic and prognostic frames, suggesting an explanation for the lack of anti-trafficking initiatives in the United States. It is unlikely that the United States can expect to combat human trafficking without a cohesive, comprehensive way of dealing with the issue. In these analyses, the prognostic frames articulated by respondents did not match the diagnostic frames articulated by the various service provider groups. Possibly the reason anti-trafficking professionals have faced obstacles in educating and motivating the public around the issue of trafficking is due in part to the lack of

consistency between the solutions to combating sex trafficking and the reasons for its occurrence. The missing clarity between diagnostic and prognostic frames found in this study indicates another reason why sex trafficking is a little known illegal industry in the world. The current dialogue on the phenomenon does not present a consistent picture.

Implications for Future Research

This thesis produced several key findings to add to the growing body of literature on sex trafficking. It also suggests several avenues for future research. Of particular interest for further analysis would be to research the same service providers again and see which, if any, of their solutions they have used to stop sex trafficking. How their experience instating such solutions has been received, and whether or not they have seen a decrease in the number of sex trafficking victims would be beneficial to documenting successful practices in stopping the phenomenon.

In addition, future research should be conducted on international women in their native language so they feel more comfortable with the interviewer and are able to expound on their opinions and experiences in the sex industry. A larger sample size of health care providers would also greatly benefit the data as it pertains to the explanation and suggested solutions of service providers. Health care providers are a particular niche of professionals that potentially see victims on a regular basis. Researching whether or not these professionals know what sex trafficking is, how to

identify a victim, and who to report trafficking to is essential for rescuing victims and prosecuting traffickers.

Lastly, empirical research is needed on sex trafficking victims only to better understand the behavior and recruitment tactics of traffickers. With this information, governments and local agencies identify potential traffickers based on common behavior. Lastly, this information can be used in community advocacy campaigns to spread public awareness and alert women who may be at risk of being trafficked.

Implications for Policy

This empirical study of the explanations and solutions of sex trafficking unveils many policy implications in order to effectively combat sex trafficking. First, financial issues domestically and internationally are dominant explanations for why women enter and/or stay in sex work. Numerous respondents argued the financial deprivation women experience in developing countries is a major explanation for why sex trafficking occurs. Likewise, women's lack of opportunities for gainful employment or their lack of ability to increase their skills through education makes sex work seem like one of the only avenues for economic stability. Anti-sex trafficking activists such as law enforcement and social service agents need to evaluate the economic conditions and financial opportunities for both international and domestic women. These are large social issues that, if tackled, will address not only sex trafficking but other social problems (e.g. poverty, gender inequality). In order for this change to take place, broad-

based alliances must be made internationally. Sex trafficking is a global issue and therefore, resources need to be available to women in every country.

Another major policy implication of international trafficking is immigration. As women face financial strains in their home countries, they are likely to look to work in other countries in order to provide for themselves and their families. For women from developing countries, the idea of working in an industrialized nation brings hope of a chance to have a stable career. Often the only opportunity for them to gain access to industrialized nations is for them to enter the sex industry. The United States needs to recognize that immigration is a major factor in sex trafficking for two reasons: (1) women want to work in an industrial nation and (2) women fear the retribution they and their family may face if they are deported once identified as international sex workers. Although the United States Government now issues T-Visas to trafficking victims, law makers need to address whether these victims will be entitled to citizenship based on the conditions endured in the United States. Of additional importance, the retribution faced by victims deported after being identified can cause tremendous stress to their families and themselves. The results presented here suggest the INS needs to reconsider the immigration laws involving trafficking victims.

A major reason why sex trafficking is so hard to combat is the large range of explanations and solutions articulated by those closest to the issue. There are many push and pull factors enticing women to enter sex work, ranging from financial and

structural issues in one's sending country to drug use to sexual abuse in childhood. Perhaps not surprisingly, articulated solutions for combating sex trafficking are as varied as the explanations for its occurrence. For example, the law change frame is one requiring brute force of prosecuting offenders and instating high penalties for trafficking/pimping women. The frame providing economic opportunities for women in developing countries calls for addressing the problem at the root of the cause. The diagnostic and prognostic frames articulated by respondents suggest that addressing sex trafficking will require a combination of measures that address the structural causes, inflict harsher penalties, and offer alternative options to women pushed and pulled into the industry.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

Interview Guide for the “Future Goals/Recommendations” Section

International and Domestic Women that have/are Working in the Sex Industry in the US:

1. What do you need to be able to achieve the [best life for you now]?
 - Education
 - Job Skills Training
 - Financial Aid
 - Housing/Safe Relocation
 - New Identity
 - Asylum
 - Other, Please Describe
2. What do you think needs to change to make things better for women in your situation or women who may find themselves in your situation?
3. What do you think needs to happen to:
 - Trafficked Women?
 - Traffickers?
 - Buyers?
 - Establishments Involved in Sex Trade?
4. What do you feel would be necessary to stop sex trafficking in this country?
 - Education/Informational Campaigns
 - Service Coordination/Collaboration
 - Change in Laws
 - Consistent/Uniform Enforcement
 - Stricter Penalties for Traffickers
 - Other
5. Do you believe that the laws and penalties for this crime adequately address the issue?

Law Enforcement Officials:

1. What are the causes of trafficking? Who or what factors do you believe are responsible for this problem?
2. Do you think that most women voluntarily choose to enter the sex industry?

3. What do women need in order not to fall prey to this type of situation?
4. What do you think needs to happen to:
 - Trafficked Women?
 - Traffickers?
 - Buyers?
 - Establishments Involved in Sex Trade?
5. What do you feel would be necessary to stop sex trafficking in this country?
 - Education/Informational Campaigns
 - Service Coordination/Collaboration
 - Change in Laws
 - Consistent/Uniform Enforcement
 - Stricter Penalties for Traffickers
 - Other
6. Do you believe that the laws and penalties for this crime adequately address the issue?

Social Service Agents:

1. What do women need in order not to fall prey to this type of situation?
2. What do you think needs to happen in the criminal justice or immigration system to: Trafficked women? Traffickers? Buyers? Establishments involved in sex trade?
3. What do you think needs to happen to:
 - Trafficked Women?
 - Traffickers?
 - Buyers?
 - Establishments Involved in Sex Trade?
4. Do you believe that the laws and penalties for this crime adequately address the issue?

Health Care Providers:

1. What are the causes of trafficking? Who or what factors do you believe are responsible for this problem?

2. Do you think that most women voluntarily choose to enter the sex industry?
3. What do women need in order not to fall prey to this type of situation?
4. What do you think needs to happen to:
 - Trafficked Women?
 - Traffickers?
 - Buyers?
 - Establishments Involved in Sex Trade?
5. What do you feel would be necessary to stop sex trafficking in this country?
 - Education/Informational Campaigns
 - Service Coordination/Collaboration
 - Change in Laws
 - Consistent/Uniform Enforcement
 - Stricter Penalties for Traffickers
 - Other
6. Do you believe that the laws and penalties for this crime adequately address the issue?

Appendix B

Table 3.1: Diagnostic Frames

	All Respondents	Sex Workers	Law Enforcement Officials	Social Service Agents	Health Care Providers
Financial Issues	52% 54	29% 12 ⁹	74% 14	68% 26	33% 2
Personal Impairment					
Drug Use	5% 5	12% 5 ¹⁰			
Psychological Issues	3% 3		16% 3		
Sexual Abuse	3% 3		16% 3		
Other	9% 9		16% 3	13% 5	17% 1
Structural					
Involuntary	11% 11			29% 11	
Patriarchy	9% 9			24% 9	
No Frame Articulated	43% 45	66% 27 ¹¹	53% 10	13% 5	50% 3
n	104	41	19	38	6

Source: International and Domestic Trends in Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, 1999-2000

Note: Percents do not sum to 100 and frequencies do not match the sample-specific n's because individual respondents could articulate more than one frame.

⁹ 7 Domestic and 5 International Sex Workers

¹⁰ 4 Domestic and One International Sex Worker

¹¹ 17 Domestic and 10 International Sex Workers

Appendix C

Table 3.2: Prognostic Frames

	All Respondents	Sex Workers	Law Enforcement Officials	Social Service Agents	Health Care Providers
Financial					
Financial Opportunities	10% 10		21% 4	16% 6	
Education/Schooling Needed	8% 8	5% 2 ¹²		16% 6	
Legal					
Law Change Needed	20% 21		53% 10	29% 11	
Witness Protection Program	6% 6		32% 6		
Trusted Law Enforcement	5% 5		26% 5		
Visa	7% 7			18% 7	
Other Legal Solutions	5% 5		21% 4	3% 1	
Social Services					
More Social Services	6% 6			16% 6	
Affordable Housing	2% 2				33% 2
Shelter Needed	4% 4		21% 4		
Other Social Services	14% 15	15% 6	21% 4	11% 4	17% 1
No Frame Articulated	48% 50	85% 35 ¹³	11% 2	26% 10	50% 3
n	104	41	19	38	6

Source: International and Domestic Trends in Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, 1999-2000

Note: Percents do not sum to 100 and frequencies do not match the sample-specific n's because individual respondents could articulate more than one frame.

¹² One Domestic and One International Sex Worker

¹³ 21 Domestic and 14 International Sex Workers

Appendix D

Table 3.3: Comparing and Contrasting Diagnostic and Prognostic Frames

	Financial	Personal Impairment	Structural	No Frame Articulated
Financial	17% 9	63% 7	36% 8	4% 2
Legal	37% 20	73% 8	41% 9	8% 4
Social Service	26% 14	36% 4	27% 6	0% 0
No Frame Articulated	24% 13	18% 2	14% 3	
n	54	11	22	45

Source: International and Domestic Trends in Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States, 1999-2000

Note: Percents do not sum to 100 and frequencies do not match the sample-specific n's because individual respondents could articulate more than one frame.

REFERENCES

- Aaronson, S., & Zimmerman, J. (2006). Fair trade?: How Oxfam presented a systemic approach to poverty, development, human rights, and trade. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 28, 998-1030.
- Bales, K. (2005). *Understanding Global Slavery: A Reader*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Benford, R., & Snow, D. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26, 611-39.
- Benford, R. (1997). An insider's critique of the social movement framing perspective. *Sociological Inquiry*, 67(4), 409-430.
- Bernard, H. (2000). *Social research methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. New York: Sage Publications Incorporated.
- Brennan, D. (2005). Methodological challenges in research with trafficked persons: Tales from the field. *International Migration*, 43(1/2), 35-54.
- Brooks, S. (2005). *Producing security: Multinational corporations, globalization, and the changing calculus of conflict*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Budd, R., Thorp, R., & Donohew, L. (1967). *Content Analysis of Communications*. New York: The MacMillan Company.
- Coalition Against Trafficking Women-International. (2006). An Introduction to CATW. <http://www.catwinternational.org/about/index.php>
- Coy, P., & Woehrle, L. (1996). Constructing identity and oppositional knowledge: The framing practices of peace movement organizations during the Persian Gulf War. *Sociological Spectrum*, 16, 287-327.
- David, F. (2007). Law enforcement responses to trafficking in persons: Challenges and emerging good practice. *Trends & Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice*, 347, 1-6.
- Desyllas, M. (2007). A critique of the global trafficking discourse and US policy. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 3(4), 57-79.

- Donovan, B. Framing and strategy: Explaining differential longevity in the women's Christian temperance union and the anti-saloon league. *Sociological Inquiry*, 65(2), 143-155.
- Drake, L., & Donogue, W. (1996). Communicative framing theory in conflict resolution. *Communication Research*, 23(2), 297-322.
- Fairhurst, G., & Sarr, R. (1996). *The Art of Framing*. San Francisco, CA: Josey-Bass Publishers.
- Farley, M. (2003). *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*. New York: The Haworth Maltreatment & Trauma Press.
- Farr, K. (2005). *Sex Trafficking: The Global Market in Women and Children*. New York: Worth Publishers.
- Gillian, F., & Bales, S. (2001). Strategic frame analysis: Reframing America's youth. *Social Policy Report: Giving Child and Youth Development Knowledge Away*, 15(3), 3-14.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Goodey, J. (2003). Migration, crime and violence. *Punishment & Society*, 5(4), 415-431.
- Gozdziak, E., & Collett, E. (2005). Research on human trafficking in North America: A review of literature. *International Migration*, 43(1/2), 99-128.
- Granberg, E. (2006). "Is that all there is?" Possible selves, self-change, and weight loss. *Social Psychology Quarterly*, 69(2), 109-126.
- Hodge, D.R. (2008). Sexual trafficking in the United States: A domestic problem with transnational dimensions. *Social Work*, 53(2), 143-152.
- Holsti, O. (1969). *Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities*. Philippines: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc.
- Hughes, D. (2003). The driving force of sex trafficking: The demand. *Vital Speeches of the Day*, 69(6), 182-184.
- Hyland, K. (2001). Protecting human victims of trafficking: An American framework. *Berkeley Women's Law Journal*, 16(29), 29-71.

- Initiative Against Sexual Trafficking. (2006). Initiative Against Sexual Trafficking c/o The Salvation Army National Headquarters. <ww.iast.net>
- Joachim, J. (2003). Framing issues and seizing opportunities: The UN, NGOs, and women's rights. *International Studies Quarterly*, 47, 247-274.
- Jones, L., Engstrom, D., Hilliard, T., & Diaz, M. (2007). Globalization and human trafficking. *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*, 34(2), 107-122.
- Kissane, R., & Gingerich, J. (2004). Do you see what I see? Nongovernmental and resident perceptions of urban neighborhood problems. *Nongovernmental and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 33(2), 311-33.
- Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content Analyses: An Introduction to its Methodology*. Thousand Oaks: CA, Sage Publications.
- Kyle, D. & Koslowski, R. (2001). *Global human smuggling: Comparative perspectives*. Maryland: The John Hopkins University Press.
- Long, L. (2004). Anthropological perspectives on the trafficking of women for sexual exploitation. *International Migration*, 42 (1). 5-31.
- McCammon, H., Campbell, K., Granberg, E., & Mowery, C. (2001). How movements win: Gendered opportunity structures and US women's suffrage movements, 1866 to 1919. *American Sociological Review*, 66, 49-70.
- McCammon, H., Hewitt, L., & Smith, S. (2004). "No weapon save argument': Strategic frame amplification in the US woman suffrage movements. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 45(3), 529-556.
- McGill, C. (2003). *Human Traffic: Sex, Slaves and Immigration*. London: Satin Publications Ltd.
- McGuire, L. (2003). Using qualitative methods to evaluate a group: Does the survival skills for women program increase self-sufficiency? *Social Work for Groups*, 26(4), 43-57.
- Naim, M. (2005). *Illicit*. New York: Doubleday.
- Omelandiuk, I. (2005). Trafficking in human beings. *United Nations Expert Group Meeting on International Migration and Development*.

- Prasad, A. (2004). Jack Donnelly's universal human rights theory and practice. *Alternatives: Turkish Journal of International Relations*, 3(2&3).
- Raymond, Janice G., and Donna M. Hughes. INTERNATIONAL AND DOMESTIC TRENDS IN SEX TRAFFICKING OF WOMEN IN THE UNITED STATES, 1999-2000 [Computer file]. ICPSR version. Amherst, MA: Coalition Against Trafficking Women [producer], 2002. Ann Arbor, MI: Inter-university Consortium for Political and Social Research [distributor], 2003.
- Robnett, B. (2004). Emotional resonance, social location, and strategic framing. *Sociological Focus*, 37(3), 195-212.
- Saunders, P. (2005). Traffic violations: Determining the meaning of violence in sexual trafficking versus sex work. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 20(3), 343-360.
- Schrock, D., Holden, D., & Reid, L. (2004). Creating emotional resonance: Interpersonal emotion work and motivational framing in a transgender community. *Social Problems*, 51(1), 61
- Segrave, M., & Milivojevic, S. (2005). Sex trafficking- A new agenda. *Social Alternatives*, 24(2), 11-17.
- Snow, D., Rochford, E., Worden, S., & Benford, R. (1986). Frame alignment processes, micromobilization, and movement participation. *American Sociological Review*, 51, 464-481.
- Steen, S. Contested portrayals: Medical and legal social control of juvenile sex offenders. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 42(3), 325-350.
- Steinberg, M. (1998). Tilting the frame: Considerations on collective action framing from a discursive turn. *Theory and Society*, 27, 845-872.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (2005). *Fact sheet on human trafficking*. Retrieved August 20, 2008, from http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking_victims_consent.html.
- United States Department of State [US DOS]. (2007) *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Washington, DC: US Government Printing.
- United States Department of Justice [US DOJ]. (2000). *Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000*. Retrieved October 10, 2007 from http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/TVP_A_2000.pdf.

US Department of Health and Human Services [US DHHS]. (2004). *Human trafficking fact sheet: Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000*. Retrieved October 16, 2007 from <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/factsheets.html>

US Department of Health and Human Services [US DHHS]. (2006). *Administration for Children and Families*. Retrieved October 10, 2007 from www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking.

Weber, R. (1990). *Basic Content Analysis, 2nd edition*. London: Sage Publications.

Wilson, D., Walsh, W., & Kleuber, S. (2006). Trafficking in human beings: Training and services among US law enforcement agencies. *Police Practice and Research*, 7(2), 149-160.

Yang, J. (2003). Framing the NATO air strikes in Kosovo across countries. *The International Journal of Communication Studies*, 65(3), 231-249.