THE ECONOMIC SITUATION
A Quarterly Commentary

Bruce Yandle
Distinguished Adjunct Professor of Economics, Mercatus Center at George Mason University,
Dean Emeritus, College of Business & Behavioral Science, Clemson University

Note: Cartoonist Robert Arial generously allows his cartoons to be used in the Economic Situation report.

yandle@bellsouth.net

September 2013

• Hoping for three-lane prosperity on a two-lane road.
• Some ups and downs.
• Looking for Waldo and the U.S. labor force.
• Some geographic considerations.
• A summary statement
• Recommended fall reading.

Hoping for Three-Lane Prosperity on a Two-Lane Road

Cartoonist Robert Arial captures the essence of the economic moment with his Fourth of July cartoon. There will be no rocket's red glare this year. Why? Arial blames energy regulation. But the economic wet blanket could just as well be labeled monetary policy, or healthcare policy, or credit market controls, or environmental policy. But it is not policy per se that chills the economy—it is uncertainty with respect to policy. Most business people tell me, “Just let us know the rules of the game, and we will figure out a way to play.” It is awfully hard to play the game when rules are being changed without a clue as to when they will become final.
Today’s world has enough risk and uncertainty without more being added by Washington.

**There’s slow traffic on GDP highway**

When policy uncertainty is folded into an economy where consumer balance sheets are still bruised, where state and local budgets are stressed, and employment growth is miserable, we get an economy that struggles to grow at 2% annually, instead of hitting the 3% real GDP growth that we think of as the norm.

*We are traveling on a three-lane GDP expressway with one lane closed.*

Even worse, we are locked in slow moving traffic, and our gas gauge is pointing to empty. Worse than that, we are borrowing gas from other places and people just to keep our engine running.

*We are part of a two-lane deficit economy without a filling station in sight.*

Have you ever faced this problem? Orange barrels everywhere. Little prospect of reaching an exit any time soon. A knot in the pit of your stomach? Worried about running out of gas, and wondering if some kind soul will assist you?

If so, you understand the relief that comes when finally you see service station markers ahead.

Believe it or not, there is some relief in sight for our economy…, maybe. We see the latest GDP growth data in the next chart. The 4-quarter moving average points toward 2.0%, and there is general agreement that we are headed in that direction. But here’s the better news. There are good signs that the third lane will open in 2014, that the economy will again chug along with 3.0% real GDP growth.
But there’s still some catching up to do

Yes, 3.0% real GDP growth is out there waiting for some additional real consumer purchasing power. The next chart describes this piece of the 3.0% puzzle.

Here we see total U.S. real disposable personal income for January 1994 through June 2013. The chart’s red line shows the start of the recent recession. But it is the white trend line that deserves attention. The gap between “trend” and “actual” forms part of the gap between 2.0% and 3.0% GDP growth.

We will see solid 3.0% real GDP growth when consumers have the purchasing power to make it happen and when employer and worker incentives combine to yield a larger workforce. More on this later.
Lending is up, but there’s room for lots more.

When will it happen? There is always more to the story. Recent commercial and industrial loan data from the U.S. banking system shown next tell us that the nation’s pulse beat is definitely getting stronger. Seen as a measure of core economic activity, the June loan level is just about where it stood when the last recession began. We are operating at 2008 levels in a 2013 economy. This may feel better, but it is surely not progress.
There is immense ability to lend.

While banks are definitely lending, in spite of tighter regulatory standards, their ability to lend, as shown by excess reserves, is hardly being tapped. The next chart shows the level of excess reserve for the banking system. I have marked the three periods of quantitative easing. Each time the Fed has injected more money into the system, reserves have risen by almost as much as the injection itself. And most of that injected money is still on the back shelf, resting in bank reserves while earning a low level of interest from the Fed itself. One thing is certain, based on reserves, there is ample capacity for funding a three-lane GDP highway.

Some Ups and Downs

When we look for the return of 3.0% real GDP growth, there is still more to consider. The developing world, previously the hottest part of the global economy, is another part of the two-lane GDP highway story. I next provide estimates from the International Monetary Fund (IMF) for 2014 real GDP growth for the top-40 countries, minus one. I have omitted the South Sudan from the chart because its 49% growth rate would simply wipe out the rest of the chart. I have marked India and China in red, since they are the two large economies in the data set.

Generally speaking, the expected growth rates for the developing world, while still large, have fallen by two percentage points in the last 18 months. This slowdown is obviously a negative factor for the United States. But, while the developing world is slowing, the
developed world is picking up. By the way, the IMF predicts U.S. GDP growth will hit 3.0% in 2014.

What about Egypt and the Middle East?

Turmoil in Egypt and much of the rest of the Middle East raises a question about impact on the U.S. economy. There are obviously many complex interactions to consider, but the simplest and most direct impact relates to U.S. exports. U.S. exports to the Middle East and North Africa in 2008, the latest data available to me, amounted to $67 billion or 5.1% of total U.S. exports. For comparison, the U.S. exports about $200 billion to Mexico each year. Of Middle East countries, the UAE is the largest U.S. customer, receiving some $15.7 billion in U.S. goods in 2008. Israel is second, with $14.5 billion. Then Saudi Arabia, $12.5 billion, and finally Egypt with $6.0 billion. As we used to say in business, “every order counts.” Still, the risk of export losses in the Middle East is relatively small.
Housing recovery?

Robert Arial’s cartoon hits a sensitive issue. The stock market has recovered and is now—finally—hitting some new highs. Not so for a significant part of the labor market.

The recovery of housing construction is critical to the recovery of employment for a population of workers with high skills but low educational attainment. Consider the next pie chart. Here we see some July 2013 labor market data. The pie slices reflect the labor market participation rate based on educational attainment. This is the share of the adult work-age population working or looking for work. Labels on the slices give the unemployment rate for each group. Notice the obvious. The higher the level of educational attainment, the larger the participation rate..., and the lower the unemployment rate. The point: there are not many people with bachelor degrees working as roofers, framers, and carpenters. But there are a lot of high school graduates and people without high school diplomas who seek those high skill jobs.

I’ve made the point before. No matter how much stimulus money Washington pumps into the economy, there is just no way to convert highly skilled carpenters and dry wall hangers into knowledge economy workers. But, recovery of housing construction can bring them on.
Fortunately, there is significant improvement in the housing start data. As shown in the next chart, based on recent improvements, the U.S. housing sector should hit the red-line construction norm of 1.6 million starts annually in 2016. Meanwhile, things are getting better for lots of construction sector workers.
Where is Waldo and the U.S. Labor Force?

At one time or another, we have all been intrigued by graphic puzzles that invite us to find Waldo, the proverbial everyman lost in a photo packed with people. A creation of Martin Handford, British writer of children’s stories, finding Waldo in the crowd can be fun for young and old alike. But Handford offers puzzles that can be solved. Look long enough and Waldo will surface.

Would that the search for the U.S. labor force in these times was as easy.

We all know the rhetoric. When looking for economic progress in monthly data, instead of focusing on the unemployment rate, which can fall when discouraged job seekers bail out of the market, we should zero in on the employment rate, the share of the work-age population that seeks to participate in the workforce. But when we look, what we observe will be the result of millions of individual decisions based on incentives, opportunities, and personal forecasts as to what is best for the individual person.

The result of all this is provided monthly by the Bureau of Labor Statistics Civilian Labor Force Participation Rate, a number that has fallen sharply since the Great Recession began in January 2008. In fact, as shown in the accompanying chart, the number was falling before the recession began at the point marked with a red upright. The July 2013 number stood at 63.4. In January 2008, when the economy hit the sliding board, the number was 66.4. The difference in those two numbers accounts for a labor force loss of 6.3 million workers. But even more troubling to some, the July number is the lowest since May of 1979.

Where are those 6.3 million work-age Americans? Are they out-of-work carpenters, brick masons, and dry wall installers hoping for housing to boom again? Are they in college? Disabled? Have they started businesses at home and somehow don’t get counted as employed?

Let’s see if we can find the missing part of the U.S. labor force. Where is Waldo?
A quick glance at the next chart suggests that about two million of the missing workers may be associated with lost jobs in the construction industry. Yes, it is possible for employment losses in one sector to be offset by gains in other sectors for the same workers, but perfect substitution just doesn’t work so well for specialized construction workers.
Call this two million part of the missing group, and we are left to find 4.3 million more.

The next chart shows the share of the 18-24 population enrolled in post-secondary education. Notice how enrollment skyrocketed after 2007. When translated into people count, about 2.4 million more have enrolled in school since 2007. Keep in mind that this is just the younger part of the enrolled population. There are also a lot of the over-24 group going to classes.

It only makes sense. Wages foregone is the largest part of the cost of going to college. And if there is no work available, that part falls to zero. Add to this the availability of generous student loans subsidized by dear old Uncle Sam, you and me, my friend, and the industry booms. In academic year 2007-2008, total loans and federal grants to college students stood at $105.8 million in 2011 dollars. By 2011-2012, the total was $173.7 million, and rising. This looks a lot like a growth industry to me…, at least until the day of reckoning arrives.

If we take this 2.4 million into account, that leaves about two million more displaced job seekers to account for.

Let’s look at the count of people on disability. Since 2008, there has been a one million increase in the number of work-age Americans receiving disability payments from the
Social Security fund. These are individuals who previously participated in the labor force but because of some physical or mental difficulty are no longer participating, and unlikely to return to work. On average, a disabled worker receives about $1,200 tax-free dollars each month, perhaps for life, along with “free” Medicare hospital coverage for two years. Returning to work ends all this, and that’s a pretty hefty “tax” to pay for the privilege of working.

This leaves one million nonworking Waldos unaccounted for. Finding that group may not be as easy as the first few million.

![U.S. Working Age Population with Disability](chart.png)

But there is another important group to consider. These are folks who started small businesses after losing their regular jobs. While they are technically still participating in the labor force, I am guessing that when labor market surveys are taken the data become rather blurred for this group. Why would I say that?

Consider the Kauffman Entrepreneurship Index. This number is generated based on a large-sample survey that estimates the number of people out of 100,000 who started a business in the year of the survey. The next chart gives the results. First, notice how the number shot skyward as the recession became more severe. And notice how the number recedes as the recession goes away. The data indicate clearly the old adage: when the going gets tough, the tough get going.
According to the Kauffman data, there were more than 580,000 new businesses started each month in 2010. The monthly increase fell to 514,000 in 2012. The difference? About 70,000 new businesses each month. If there is one person involved in each business that yields roughly 840,000 individuals who may have been previously employed in what I will call the traditional workforce.

Keep in mind that some, if not all, of these will be accounted for the monthly employment survey that seeks to determine who is working, wishing to work, or no longer looking. But it is my guess that a lot of these entrepreneurs are missed in the count.

We have gotten close to the 8.3 million workers who are no longer participating in the labor force.

And what will happen when the three-lane economy opens up and real annual GDP growth rises from 2.0% to 3.0%? Some of the entrepreneurs will decide they are better off being on someone else’s payroll and will return to the traditional labor force. But others will not. Some of the disabled will decide their fortunes are better served by getting back to work, but many will not. A large number of students will sense the higher opportunity cost of being in school and will head to work. And a lot of construction workers will gladly get back to work, after having given up looking. But the longer the duration of the slow job market, the more likely the participation rate will not return fully to the pre-recession level. But that, too, is determined by incentives and how they may change.
Some Geographic Considerations

Line graphs and pie charts may convey useful information about overall economic performance, but most of us really want to know about the outlook in our home territories. After all, things may look a lot better on average, but still seem awfully bleak in our particular town, county or state. The outline maps that follow offer some geographic insights for housing construction, tax revenues flows, and the ultimate economic test, whether more people are leaving a state or heading to it.

Housing start growth reflected in May 2012 data is shown in the next map. Darker brown corresponds with higher growth. The lightest tan marks negative growth, as seen in New Mexico, Oklahoma, Kansas, Iowa, Wisconsin, and Oregon, for example.

Population growth, 2011-2012, is shown in the next chart. Again, darker brown means higher growth. People voting with their feet tell us that they prefer what is going on west of the Mississippi River, showing particular affection for Texas and the Dakotas. Could it be about employment opportunities?
We get an answer to this question in the next chart, which shows the July unemployment rate by state. In this map, the lighter hues indicate lower unemployment rates. Once again, west of the Mississippi seems preferred, with the exception of the Pacific states.
A Summary Statement

So how do we sum up? What is the September 2013 economic situation? The developing world is slowing down, but the older developed world is chugging ahead. Economic risks in the Middle East, which reflect horrible human tragedy, are manageable. Major parts of the economy are showing strength. We see this in manufacturing, wholesale shipments, auto sales, retail sales, and we are beginning to see major improvement in the housing sector. Unemployment rates for the college educated are very low. But the unemployment rate for the lesser educated is pretty dismal. There are good prospects for improvement that will come as the construction sector builds a full head of steam.

But even when that happens, we will still not see solid 3.0% real GDP growth on a regular basis, unless a good many who are now out of the labor force decide to go to work. Many will do just that when incentives change. When sitting in school comes at the cost of a good salary that can be earned, many college students will decide to put their improved human capital to work. When markets get tighter, and payrolls begin to grow, many of those who started their own small firms will decide they would prefer the security and regular pay that comes with working for someone else. And as things improve even more, some who are now on disability, upon seeing real opportunities to secure a good job, will move into the labor market.

And along the way, it is even possible, though not very likely, that the federal government will reduce some policy uncertainty instead of adding more.

Then, we will be back on the three-lane highway again.

Some Early Fall Reading

Once September arrives, it is too late to talk about summer reading, but it is a perfect time to suggest books for the fall. I draw on some of my summer reading to offer some fall suggestions. American Exceptionalism by AEI Scholar Charles Murray is just out. This AEI Press book is just 50 pages long and small enough to fit in a coat pocket. But while the book is small, the topic is large, often debated, and frequently misunderstood. Murray starts by reminding us that exceptional doesn’t necessarily mean better. I would put the matter in statistical terms and suggest that we considering an observation in the history of nationhood that is several standard deviations off the mean. Murray identifies
dimensions worth thinking about and measuring, and while he praises past exceptionalism, he leaves serious questions about whether the nation is still exceptional. As they say, you will have to read this small book to get his message.

*The Folio Book of Historic Speeches*, edited by Ian Pindar and published by the London Folio Society is a 2007 book. My copy was delivered to me by Dot following a day’s trek through some thrift shops. Boy, do I feel lucky to have this 2007 beauty. The book is built of historic speeches—short ones, 108 in all. Beginning with Moses and ending with Neil Armstrong, Buzz Aldrin, and Michael Collins, these short speeches are arranged chronologically and also logically in terms of competing and conflicting voices that address similar issues. For example, World War II is covered by Neville Chamberlain, Winston Churchill, Philippe Petain, Charles de Gaulle, Dwight Eisenhower, Adolph Hitler, and Clement Atlee, along with others. And the editor’s introduction to each major event or section provides excellent context. I liked the book so much that I searched the web and found used copies for my children and grandchildren. If you love history and the people who made it or interpreted it by their words and actions, you will really love this one.

As another suggestion for fall reading, I recommend another older book. *Revolutionary Wealth*, a 2006 book by Alvin and Heidi Toffler. This is just one more book from a long list of important works that I just missed. The revolutionary wealth is knowledge as it impacts the knowledge economy. Following in the tradition of their *Future Shock* and *The Third Wave*, the Tofflers provide plenty to think about. Their ideas are novel; their criticisms are balanced and informed; and their forecasts are fascinating. And if you did not read the book when it first was published, you get to have the pleasure of seeing if their forecasts were in any way accurate. There are lots of used copies available for this one.

And just in case you wish to get into a short novel, one that is hard to put down, let me recommend Jon Buchan’s *Code of the Forest*. This is lawyer Buchan’s first book. It is set in coastal South Carolina, perhaps in the 1970s. It is a story about a newspaper editor’s efforts to uncover an environmental tradeoff that involves powerful politicians, industrialists and assorted good ole boys. This one is a good read that may just remind you of some folks you’ve known back home.